





FAX

76 South Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308

330-384-5849 Fax: 330-384-3875

PUCO PUCO PUCO PUCO

Arthur E. Korkosz Senior Allorney

December 14, 2009

Via Federal Express and Facsimile (614-466-0313)

Ms. Renee J. Jenkins
Director, Administration Department
Secretary to the Commission, Docketing Division
The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Re: In the Matter of the Investigation into the Development of the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test Pursuant to S.B. 221 for Case No. 09-786-EL-UNC.

Dear Ms. Jenkins:

Enclosed for filing, please find the original and seventeen (17) copies of the Comments filed by Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company relating to the above referenced case. Please file the enclosed in the above-referenced docket, time-stamping the two extras and returning them to the undersigned in the enclosed envelope.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter. Please contact me if you have any questions concerning this matter.

Very truly yours,

Arthur E. Korkosz

AEK:sbs Enclosures

Cc: All Parties of Interest

This is to certify that the images appearing are at accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed 2-/4-07

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Investigation into the Development of the Significantly Excessive Earnings Test Pursuant to S.B. 221 for Electric Utilities

Case No. 09-786-EL-UNC

COMMENTS OF OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY, AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

Pursuant to the procedure set out in the Attorney Examiner's Entry of November 19, 2009 in the above captioned matter, Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison Company (the "Companies") herein submit their Comments in response to the Staff Recommendations issued November 18, 2009. As was evident during the course of Case No. 08-935-EL-SSO, the Companies' ESP proceeding, the Companies consider the matter of correctly developing a significantly excessive earnings test (SEET) methodology to be of considerable importance. The Companies believe they developed and supported an appropriate methodology in that case, reflecting positions which the Companies later reiterated during the course of the SEET workshop held October 5, 2009.

In some cases the Staff Recommendations reflect concurrence with the positions which have been advanced by the Companies. In some other cases, the Staff Recommendations address matters which were not issues germane to the Companies.

¹ For instance, issues associated with the SEET treatment of off-system sales (Staff Question 1) do not apply in the Companies' circumstances. Additionally, as the Companies filed their ESP case on a stand alone utility basis, the subject matter raised by Staff Question 2 was not put in issue in their case. Finally, although the Companies' divestiture of previously owned generation assets make the SEET provisions of

Accordingly, in the interest of brevity, these Comments are directed to only certain of the issues discussed in the Staff Recommendations. Moreover, to further avoid unduly burdening these Comments with repetition, the Companies request that the record in support of their positions on the SEET issue from their ESP case be incorporated by reference here and further request the Commission's favorable consideration of the Companies' positions advanced therein.

The structure of the remainder of these Comments tracks the specific Staff Recommendations.

3. What adjustments should be included in the SEET calculation? and 11. How should write-offs and deferrals be reflected in the return on equity calculation for SEET?

The Companies generally concur with the apparent thrust of the Staff Recommendation, but find portions of the Recommendation unclear. The Recommendation states that the SEET should use unadjusted (emphasis added) financial results, but further states that extraordinary items should be excluded and that adjustments should be made to remove items associated with non-Ohio service areas. The Companies agree that extraordinary or nonrecurring items, or those which are otherwise non-representative of a utility's operations, should be excluded from the calculation. As a clarification of this position, the Companies suggest the following prescription for the SEET calculation:

R.C. 4928.142 inapplicable to their circumstances, the Companies believe their views as to the proper application of the statutory SEET are applicable to its formulation for purposes of both R.C. 4928.142 and R.C. 4928.143. The Staff Recommendation does not appear to distinguish between the two statutory sections.

For purposes of calculating SEET, net income applicable to common shareholders shall be adjusted to exclude extraordinary or nonrecurring items, those which are otherwise non-representative of a utility's operations, and any specific adjustments defined in a utility's Electric Security Plan then in effect. The denominator shall be the average monthly common equity balance during the measurement period, adjusted to exclude the related effects of any items excluded from net income above.

The resulting adjusted return on common equity becomes the reference point as described further below in the Companies' response to Question 5.

4. What is the precise accounting definition of "earned return on common equity" that should be used?

The Companies concur with the Staff Recommendation on this question, a particularly important aspect of which is its adoption of a methodology which captures an average of common equity over all months of the year rather than risking the prospect of the calculation being improperly skewed by the use of a potentially unrepresentative single point measure of equity. Additionally, as the Companies urged in their ESP case, it is appropriate to exclude extraordinary or nonrecurring items, or those which are otherwise non-representative of a utility's operations, in order to maintain comparability with the sample of companies against which the utility's earnings are being considered.

5. What is the definition of "significantly in excess of the return on common equity"?

This issue of determining the threshold above which a return on equity is determined to be "significantly in excess of the return on common equity" was among the most contentious and fully developed SEET related issue in the Companies' ESP proceeding. The Staff's Recommendation here reflects a methodology which the Companies believe uses the minimum (i.e. most conservative) acceptable statistical confidence level (90%) and, assuming a sample group as proposed by the Companies, also helps protect against the prospect of a "false positive" result (i.e. the SEET would incorrectly identify the utility's earnings as significantly excessive). It also mitigates the problem of imposing an asymmetric risk upon the utilities with respect to not being able to actually earn the return allowed by the Commission in application of the SEET.²

It is important to recognize, however, that the recommendation of the 90% confidence level (corresponding to the 1.28 multiplier applied to the standard deviation) was dependent upon the sample proposed in the Companies' case, which sample, consistent with the language of the statute, included companies from industries other than the utility, or more specifically, just the electric utility industry. If, however, the sample of other companies used was more restrictive, for example, being limited only to regulated utilities or just electric utilities, it would be appropriate to use a higher confidence level (e.g., 95% or 97.5%) since the distribution of returns within these more restricted samples would likely be less variable and, accordingly, increase the danger of the test resulting in false positives and yielding the incorrect implication of significantly

² See Companies' Exhibit 8, Direct Testimony of Michael J. Vilbert, pp. 14-20, Case No. 08-935-EL-SSO.

excessive earnings.³ Moreover, it should be remembered that an additional consideration beyond the mechanical application of a mathematical test is imposed by the statute in its requirement that "[c]onsideration shall also be given to the capital requirements of future committed investments in this state." R.C. 4928.143(F).

The Companies concur in the Staff's application of a 200 basis point minimum increment above the mean return of the sample group as a "backstop" which would "keep the threshold for excess at a reasonable distance from the mean when earning on an industry-wide basis contract." The Companies agree with the Staff that "[t]his approach will lend consistency and fairness to the process."

6. How should companies "that face comparable business and financial risk" be determined? and 9. How should the earnings of a comparable company be adjusted to compensate for the financial risk difference associated with the difference in capital structure?

The Companies have no particular objection to the Staff's view that "it is appropriate that a comparable group sample be determined and utilized on a case-by-case basis." The Companies believe, however, that the sample selection methodology they proposed for selecting companies of comparable business risk in their ESP case continues to be applicable not only to them but, given its theoretical underpinnings, would be appropriate more broadly in the application of the SEET to all electric utilities in the state. A benefit of having a uniformly applied methodology would be to reduce potential uncertainty in application of the SEET from year to year and from utility to utility. Of

³ Id. at p. 16.

course if the circumstances in a particular situation justified a departure from application of the uniform methodology, a departure in that case could be made on a one-off basis.

As to the recognition of financial risk in the comparison of the utility to the sample group, the Staff "prefers" the approach which reflects that advocated by the Companies⁴ and which does not use leverage as a "factor in group selection" but, instead, adjusts "the resulting returns for the comparable group companies". The benefit, as Staff recognizes, is that this approach "enables a larger sample [of comparable companies] to be used" and thus "enables greater validity for the results." Here again, although the Staff has stopped short of recommending application of this approach in all cases, the Companies believe that general application of this "preferable" approach for the SEET test is appropriate and would reduce uncertainty in its application while still permitting a departure from the methodology if circumstances warrant.

7. How are "significantly excessive carnings" to be determined? (Located in the third sentence of Section 4928.143(F), Revised Code.)

Please see the Companies' Comments with respect to Staff Recommendation 5, supra.

8. What does "in the aggregate" mean in relation to the adjustments resulting in significantly excess eanings?

The Companies have no comment on the Staff's views with respect to this question at this time.

⁴ In both their ESP case and in the determination of allowed return on equity in their most recent distribution rate case (Case No. 07-551-EL-AIR).

10. What mechanism should be employed to return to customers the amount of excess earnings?

The Companies concur in the Staff Recommendation that the return mechanism should be decided on a case-by-case basis which provides flexibility in crafting an approach which best addresses the particular circumstances of a utility and its customers.

Respectfully submitted,

Arthur E. Korkosz (Attorney No. 0010587)

FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

Telephone: (330) 384-5849

Facsimile: (330) 384-3875 korkosza@firstenergycorp.com

ATTORNEY FOR OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY, AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Comments filed by Ohio Edison, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company was served by United States Mail, prepaid, to the following persons, this 14th day of December 2009:

One of the Attorneys for Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company.

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Robert Fortney 180 East Broad St., 3rd Floor Columbus, OH 43215

Industrial Energy Users (IEU)
Samuel C. Randazzo
Lisa G. McAlister
Daniel J. Neilsen
Joseph M. Clark
McNees Wallace & Nurick LIC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215

Ohio Energy Group (OEG)
Michael L. Kurtz
David F. Boehm
Kurt J. Boehm
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy David C. Rinebolt Trial Attorney Colleen L. Mooney 231 West Lima Street PO Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45839-1793

Ohio Consumers' Counsel
Ann M. Hotz
Jeffrey L. Small
Jacqueline Lake Roberts
Gregory J. Poulos
Michael E. Idzkowski
Richard C. Reese
Maureen Grady
10 West Broad Street, 18th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3485

Nucor Steel Marion, Inc. Garrett A. Stone Michael K. Lavanga Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone 1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW Eighth Floor, West Tower Washington, DC 20007-5201

Kroger Co
John W. Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Matthew S. White
Chester Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 E. State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC) Toledo Leslie A. Kovacik 420 Madison Avenue, Suite 100 Toledo, Ohio 43624-1219

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC) Lucas Lance M. Keiffer 711 Adams Street, 2nd Floor Toldedo, OH 43624-1680

Ohio Environmental Council Barth E. Royer Nolan Moser Trent A. Dougherty Bell & Royer, LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215 Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Holland Paul Skaff Leatherman Witzler Dombey & Hart 353 Elm Street Perrysburg, OH 43551

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Lake Thomas R. Hays Lake Township - Solicitor 3315 Centennial Road, Suite A-2 Sylvania, OH 43560

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Maumee Sheila H. McAdams Marsh & McAdams - Law Director 204 West Wayne Street Maumee, OH 43547

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Northwood Brian J. Ballenger Ballenger & Moore – Law Director 3401 Woodville Road, Suite C Toledo, OH 43619

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Oregon Paul S. Goldberg Oregon – Law Director 6800 W. Central Ave. Toledo, OH 43617-1135

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition NOAC-Sylvania James E. Moan Sylvania – Law Director 4930 Holland-Sylvania Road Sylvania, OH 43560

The Sierra Club Ohio Chapter Henry W. Eckhart 50 West Broad Street, #2117 Columbus, Oh 43215

Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc., and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. M. Howard Petricoff Stephen M. Howard Vorys, Sater, Seymore and Pease, LLP 52 East Gay Street PO Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 Cynthia A. Fonner Senior Counsel Constellation Energy Resources, LLC 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661

David I. Fein Vice President, Energy Policy - Midwest Constellation Energy Resources, LLC 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661

Integrys Energy Services, Inc.
M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Vorys, Sater, Seymore and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
PO Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Bobby Singh Integrys Energy Services, Inc 300 West Wilson Bridge Road, Suite 350 Worthington, OH 43085

Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Ohio School Boards Association, Buckeye Association of School Administrators M. Howard Petricoff Stephen M. Howard Vorys, Sater, Seymore and Pease, LLP 52 East Gay Street PO Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Direct Energy Services, LLC M. Howard Petricoff Stephen M. Howard Vorys, Sator, Seymore and Pease, LLP 52 East Gay Street PO Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Dominion Retail, Inc.
Barth E. Royer
Bell & Royer
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, QH 43215

Gary A. Jeffries Senior Counsel Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 Ohio Hospital Association Richard L. Sites General counsel and Senior Director of Health Policy 155 E. Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620

Neighborhood Environmental Coalition, Consumers for Fair Utility Rates, United Clevelanders Against Poverty, Cleveland Housing Network, The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland (Citizens Coalition) Joseph P. Meissner The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West 6th Street Cleveland, OH 44113

National Energy Marketers Assoc. Craig G. Goodman, Esq. 3333 K. Street, NW, Suite 110 Washington, D.C. 20007

Sean W. Vollman
David A. Muntean
Assistant Directors of Law
161 S. High Street, Suite 202
Akron, OH 44308

The Ohio Manufacturers' Association Langdon D. Bell Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Kevin Schmidt
The Ohio Manufacturers' Association
33 North High Street
Columbus, OH 43215-3005

Ohio Farm Bureau Federation Larry Gearhardt Chief Legal Counsel 280 North High Street Columbus, OH 43218-2383

Material Sciences Corporation Craig I. Smith 2824 Coventry Road Cleveland, OH 44120

FPL Energy Power Marketing, Inc. (PMI/GEXA) F. Mitchell Dutton 700 Universe Blvd. Juno Beach, FL 33408 FPL Energy Marketing, Inc. and Gexa Energy Holdings. LLC Dane Stinson Bailey Cavalieri LLC 10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100 Columbus, OH 43215.

The City of Cleveland
Robert J. Triozzi
Steve Beeler
Gregory J. Dunn
Patrick Bonfield
John Danish
Christopher Miller
Andre T. Porter
Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215

OmniSource Corporation
Damon E. Xenopoulos, Esq.
Shaun C. Mohler
Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.
8th Floor, West Tower
Washington, D.C. 20007

Citizen Power, Inc., David Hughes, Kelli O'Neill, and Ronald O' Conneil Theodore S. Robinson 2121 Murray Avenue Pittsburgh, Pa 15217

Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council and Ohio Schools Council Glenn S. Krassen E. Brett Breitschwerdt Bricker & Eckler LLP 1375 E. 9th Street, Suite 1500 Cleveland, OH 44114

NOPEC Glenn S. Krassen E. Brett Breitschwerdt Bricker & Eckler LLP 1375 E. 9th Street, Suite 1500 Cleveland, OH 44114

COSE Steve Millard The Highee Building 100 Public Square, Suite 201 Cleveland, OH 44113 Wal-Mart Stores East LP and Sam's Club East, LP, Macy's Inc., and BJ's Wholesale Club, Inc. (Collectively, the "Commercial Group") Douglas M. Mancino McDermott Will & Emory LLP 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3800 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3218

The Commercial Group Grace Wung McDermott Will & Emery, LLP 600 Thirteenth Street, N.W. Washington, DC 20005

American Wind Energy Association, Wind on the Wires, Ohio Advanced Energy Sally Bloomfield Terrence O'Donnell Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, QH 43215-4291

Morgan Stanley Capital Group, Inc. Douglas M. Mancino McDermott Will & Emory LLP 2049 Century Park East, Suite 3800 Los Angeles, CA 90067-3218

Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc. Gregory K. Lawrence McDermott Will & Emory LLP 28 State Street Boston, MA 02109

Natural Resources Defense Council Henry W. Eckhart 50 West Broad Street, #2117 Columbus, Oh 43215

Council of Smaller Enterprises Nicholas C. York Eric D. Weldele Tucker Ellis & West L.L.P. 1225 Huntington Center 41 South High Street Columbus, OH 43215

American Electric Power Marvin Resnik Stephen Nourse 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 Duke Energy Power Rocco D'Ascenzo John Finnigan, Jr. 2500 Atrium II P.O. Box 961 Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960

Ohio Home Builders Association Thomas Frochle Lisa McAlister McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215

Dayton Power and Light Judi Sobecki 1065 Woodman Drive Dayton, OH 45432

Local 270, UWUA, AFL-CIO Robert N. Fronck 4205 Chester Avenue Cleveland, OH 44103

CURRENT Group LLC Michael Dortch Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC 65 East State Street, Suite 200 Columbus, OH 43215

John Jones William Wright Office of the Ohio Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

Steven Huhman Vice President Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc. 2000 Westchester Avenue Purchase, NY 10577

Amy Gomberg
Environment Ohio
203 East Broad Street., Suite 3
Columbus, Ohio 4321
Noel M. Morgan, Esq.
Counsel for Communities United for Action
215 E. Ninth Street, 500
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

William L. Wright, Esq.
Thomas Lindgren
Thomas W. McNamee
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Thomas J. O'Brien, Esq. Counsel for City of Cincinnati Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4236

Douglas E. Hart Greater Cincinnati Health Council 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Robert P. Malloy Village of Terrace Park Wood & Lamping 600 Vine Street Suite 2500 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Mary W. Christensen, Esq. Counsel for People Working Cooperatively, Inc. Christensen Christensen Donohatz Kettlewell & Ownes, LLC 100 East Campus View Blvd., Suite 360 Columbus, Ohio 43235

Robert Ukeiley, Esq. Law Office of Robert Ukeiley 435R Chestnut Street, Suite 1 Berea, KY 40403

Ned Ford 539 Plattner Trail Beaverereek, OH 45430

Ellis Jacobs Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. 333 West First Street, Suite 500B Dayton, Ohio 45402

Todd Williams, Esq. 4534 Douglas Road Toledo, Ohio 43613 Scott H. Debroff Stephen J. Romeo Smigel, Anderson and River Chase Center 4431 North Front Street Harrisburg, PA 17110

Daniel Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur, LLP 41 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Emma F. Hand Ethan E. RII Reed R. Presley Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP 1301 K Street NW Suite 600 East Tower Washington, D.C. 20005

Teresa Orahood Bricker & Ecker 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Benjamin Edwards Attorney at Law One East Livingston Ave Columbus, Ohio 43215

Jennifer Duffer Armstrong & Okey, Inc. 222 East Town Street 2^{ad} Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

Terry Etter Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 W. Broad Street Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215

Michael J. Settineri Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Community Improvement Corporation Norm Blanchard 806 Cochran Ave. Cambridge, Ohio 43725 Coshocton Port Authority 106 South Fourth Street Coshocton, Ohio 43812 Environment Ohio — Environmental Advocate Amy Gomberg 203 East Broad Street, Ste 3 Columbus, Ohio 43215

Fairfield County Economic Development William R Amett 210 East Main Street Room 404 Lancaster, Ohio 43130

Jennifer Garrison State Representative 93rd House District 77 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Paulding County Economic Development, Inc 101 E. Perry Street Paulding, Ohio 45879

Debbie Phillips
State Representative 92nd House District
77 South High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Southgate Corporation 1499 West Market Street P.O. Box 397 Newark, Ohio 43058.

Michelle M, Mills St. Stephen's Community House 1500 east 17th Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43219

Widener, Faia, Chris 10th Senate District Senate Building Columbus, Ohio 43215

Appalachian People's Action, Coalition Michael R. Smalz Ohio State Legal Service, Assoc. 555 Buttles Ave Columbus, Ohio 43215

Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc. VP Regulatory Affairs John Orr 111 Market Place 5th Floor Baltimore, MD 21202 Integry's Energy Services Inc. Amy Klavitar 500 W. Madison Street Suite 3300 Chicago, IL 60661

Consumer Power Line 17 State Street 19th Floor New York, NY 10004

Ohio Manufacturers Assn 33. N. High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Clinton A. Vince
Ormet Primary Aluminum Corp.
Sonnenschein Nath & Rosenthal LLP
1301 K Street N.W.
Suite 600
East Tower
Washington, D.C. 20005

Abbott Nutrition Glenn D. McGee 6480 Busch Blvd. Columbus, Ohio 43229

Environmental Management Services, Inc. P.O. Box 175 Dublin, Ohio 43017

Hon. Jimmy Stewart Ohio Senate 20th District Senate Building Columbus, Ohio 43215

International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers
Fourth
District
Corporate Plaza
6450 Rockside Woods Blvd., South
Suite 150
Independence, Ohio 44131

OSCO Industries, Inc.
John Burke
Vice President
919 Chillicothe Street
Portsmouth, Ohio 45662

Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition Paul S. Goldberg, Law Director Phillip D. Wurster, Asst. Law Director 5330 Scattan Road Oregon, Ohio 43616