

RECEIVED-DOCKE WHO . F.

2009 OCT - 1 PH 1: 46

PUCO

BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

In the Matter of the Application of

CASE NO. 08-0666-EL-BGN

Buckeye Wind, LLC, for a

Certificate to Install Numerous

Electric Generating Wind Turbines

in Champaign County to be

be :

Collected at an Electrical Substation

DISCOVERY RESPONSES OF URBANA COUNTRY CLUB

in Union Township, Champaign

County, Ohio

. .

RESPONSES OF THE URBANA COUNTRY CLUB TO BUCKEYE WIND LLC'S FIRST SET OF INTERROGATORIES AND REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS

Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code §4906-7-07, The Urbana Country Club ("UCC") hereby provides the following responses to the First Set of Interrogatories and Request for Productions of Documents served by Buckeye Wind LLC ("Buckeye").

INTERROGATORIES

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 1</u>: Identify all witnesses who intend to testify on behalf of the UCC in Case No. 08-666-EL-BGN.

At this point in time, UCC may have its Clubhouse Manager, Andy Nagel; Head Golf Professional, Pat Delaney; and American Society of Golf Course Architects ("ASGCA") member and UCC Greens Committee Chair P.B. Dye testify on its behalf at the hearing. The UCC reserves the right to add additional persons to its witness list at a later date, and will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 2</u>: Identify any witness identified in response to Interrogatory No. 1 that will testify as an expert.

P.B. Dye and Pat Delaney may testify as expert witnesses. UCC reserves the right to designate additional expert witnesses on its behalf at a later date, and will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

This	is	to	certi	fy t	hat	the	ima	ges	apı	pea	ring	are	an
acçui	rate	an	d com	plet	e re	epro	duct	ion	of	a	case	fil-	0
docu	nent	: đe	liver	ed i	n tl	he r	egul	ar	cou	rse	of	busi:	nes s
Techi	aici	an .		SF_			Date	Pr	oce	sse	a <u>/</u> 4	2-/-0	29

INTERROGATORY NO. 3: List the subject matter of each witness identified.

Pat Delaney, Head Golf Professional, may testify about golf operations and express concerns about how the proposed Project may affect such operations. P. B. Dye will testify about golf course design. Clubhouse Manager, Andy Nagel may testify about the relationship between the golf and restaurant operations. If UCC decides to add other persons to its witness list at a later date, UCC will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

INTERROGATORY NO. 4: State the opinions of each expert witnesses.

UCC objects to this interrogatory because it is overly broad and calls for narrative responses beyond the appropriate scope of interrogatories and exceeds the scope of information that an interrogatory may seek concerning experts under the Ohio Power Siting Board Rules. Moreover, Buckeye has not provided sufficient information in its application about the Project to allow UCC's experts to reach specific opinions about all of the adverse Project effects. UCC will supplement this response at the appropriate time.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 5</u>: Have any of the witnesses for UCC testified before? State the jurisdiction, case number and topic of such testimony.

The witnesses for UCC have not testified before. If UCC decides to add other persons to its witness list, UCC will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 6</u>: List the published articles for each expert witness.

Objection: This interrogatory exceeds the scope of information that an interrogatory may seek concerning expert witnesses under the Ohio Power Siting Board Rules. Notwithstanding, UCC is not aware of any articles that may have been published by its named experts.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 7</u>: Identify all individuals who are members of the UCC and provide the address for each such individual.

Objection. This interrogatory requests information that is confidential, privileged, and not relevant to the proceedings.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 8:</u> List all reasons why the UCC opposes the Buckeye application and the basis for such objection.

Objection. This interrogatory incorrectly assumes that UCC "opposes" the Buckeye application for the Project. To the contrary, UCC's petition for leave to intervene in this proceeding did not express any "opposition" to the application. Instead, the petition simply stated that UCC was "concerned about both the short and long term adverse impact and resulting economic injury to its business." Consequently, no response is necessary.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 9:</u> Identify the individual or individuals responsible for paying the legal fees for the UCC in this proceeding.

Objection. This interrogatory requests information that is confidential, privileged, and not relevant to the proceedings. In addition, this interrogatory incorrectly assumes that "individuals" are responsible for paying the legal fees for the UCC in this proceeding. Notwithstanding those objections, UCC states that the lawfully elected Board of Directors for the UCC engaged and has the sole responsibility to pay for all legal fees related to this proceeding.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 10:</u> Identify all likely adverse effects the Project will have on the UCC's business and the market value of its real property.

The short term effects depend on when construction would take place. The application notes disruption of traffic and noise during the construction phase. Because one of the construction staging areas (located at the corner of US Route 36 and Highway 814) is very near to the UCC entrance, it is probable that members will be inconvenienced and delayed in gaining access to the UCC property during the construction phase of the project.

The long term potential effects include: i) disruption to and/or destruction of the mature trees that line hole number 11 for construction of collection lines for the Project; ii) member dissatisfaction with the noise and shadow flicker on holes 4,5,6,7, and 8 from proposed turbines 48 & 49 that could cause a decline in membership or a decline in members playing golf during the affected time periods; iii) a decline in real property values based on the loss of the historic and rural setting caused by wind turbine operation; and iv) hindrance to a newly conceived marketing plan designed to highlight the historic importance of the UCC course in the game of golf.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 11</u>: Identify all individuals or entities that have funded or contributed financially to the UCC's invention in this matter, and the amounts of each individual's and/or entity's contribution.

Objection. This interrogatory requests information that is confidential, privileged, and not relevant to the proceedings. In addition, this interrogatory incorrectly assumes that "individuals or entities" have funded UCC's intervention in this proceeding. Notwithstanding those objections, UCC states that the lawfully elected Board of Directors for the UCC has funded such intervention in this proceeding.

INTERROGATORY NO. 12: Identify the officers and board members for the UCC.

Lucas Doyle, President	Todd Michael
Julia F. Johnson, Vice President	Linda Smith
Ronald Long, Secretary	Richard Anderson
Robert Buckley, Treasurer	Paul B. Dye
	Kevin Talebi

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 13</u>: Identify all individuals involved in the decision by the UCC to intervene in this proceeding.

The decision to intervene in this proceeding was made by the UCC Board after a meeting to discuss, deliberate and vote on the matter.

INTERROGATORY NO. 14: Identify how the Project will have an adverse effect on the market value of the UCC's real property.

See the answer above to Interrogatory No. 10.

INTERROGATORY NO. 15: Identify how the Project will have an adverse effect on the UCC's members, including the members' ability to play golf at the UCC.

See the answer above to Interrogatory No. 10.

INTERROGATORY NO. 16: List all claims of injuries against the UCC by employees, members, guests and others occurring on the property or adjacent to the property during the past five years.

Objection. This interrogatory requests information that is confidential, privileged, and not relevant to the proceedings.

<u>INTERROGATORY NO. 17</u>: List the UCC's total revenue, total expenses and net assets for each of the UCC's last five fiscal years.

Objection. This interrogatory requests information that is confidential, privileged, and not relevant to the proceedings.

INTERROGATORY NO. 18: Identify the individual or individuals who made the decision that the UCC move to intervene in the proceeding.

See the answer above to Interrogatory No. 12.

INTERROGATORY NO. 19: What is the market value of the UCC's real property as of the current date or as of the last market value assessment? Identify all such real property by parcel and value.

According to the Champaign County Auditor's Office, the current appraised value of all real property and improvements owned by UCC was \$2,863,040 (as further detailed below).

Parcel No:	Acres	Value
J37-10-00-47-00-001-01	30.229	\$ 163,240
J37-10-00-47-00-001-02	23.886	\$ 128,980
J37-10-00-47-00-006-01	11.913	\$ 64,330
J37-10-00-47-00-017-00	62.250	\$ 2,426,840
J37-10-00-47-00-020-00	4.000	\$ 21,600
J37-10-00-47-00-030-01	10.750	\$ 58,050
Total	143.028	\$ 2,863,040

INTERROGATORY NO. 20: Identify the person or persons responding to each interrogatory.

Pat Delaney and Golf Course Architect, P.B. Dye participated in the responses to these interrogatories in addition to the Board of Directors.

REQUEST FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS

1. Provide the CV or resume for each witness the UCC may call at the hearing.

The CV for Pat Delaney is attached. UCC is not in possession of a CV for P.B. Dye at this time. If UCC decides to have expert witnesses testify on its behalf at the hearing, UCC will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

2. Provide a copy of any testimony that any expert witness for the UCC provided in another jurisdiction on the same topic as that witness intends to address in this case.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents at this time. If UCC decides to have expert witnesses testify on its behalf at the hearing, UCC will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

3. Provide a copy of all documents and tangible objects that the UCC may offer into evidence, to which the witnesses may refer, or which the witnesses may review in preparation for their testimony.

The documents that UCC plans to present at the hearing are attached. However, the UCC has not finalized its presentation yet and reserves the right to introduce other documents that are supportive of its position. If additional documents will be used, UCC will supplement this discovery response at the appropriate time.

4. Provide copies of documents evidencing the formation and organization of the UCC, including the articles of incorporation, corporate by-laws and minutes of meetings held by the UCC within the last three years.

Objection. This interrogatory is overly broad and seeks confidential and privileged information. The minutes of meetings held by the UCC within the last three years contain confidential and privileged information. Notwithstanding, copies of such meeting minutes (with confidential and privileged information redacted) are attached along with documents evidencing the formation and organization of the UCC, including the articles of incorporation.

5. Provide copies of documents evidencing that the UCC or its members are the record owner or holder of any real property that will be affected by the Project.

Objection: UCC has no obligation or authority to provide documents related to real property owned by its members. Notwithstanding, the Champaign County Property Record Cards 1-6 for Parcel No. J37-10-00-47-00-017-00 are attached along with other similar property records that are publicly available on the Champaign County Auditor's web site. A copy of the 1927 deed from Amelia T. Marvin to The Urbana Country Club is also attached.

6. Provide copies of all documents that relate to the UCC's involvement with the Champaign County Wind Turbine Study Group.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents.

7. Provide copies of all documents that relate to the UCC's involvement with the Ohio Wind Working Group.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents.

8. Provide copies of all documents that relate to the UCC's involvement with advocation of wind farm zoning legislation before the Zoning Commission of Union Township, Champaign County.

UCC letter of May 10, 2007 to Union Township Board of Zoning Appeals and UCC Board Resolution adopted December 12, 2007 presented to Union Township are attached.

9. Provide copies of all documents that relate to the UCC's involvement with the referendum on the 2008 general election ballot for repeal of alternative wind farm legislation approved by Union Township.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents.

10. Provide copies of all documents that refer to, evidence, or are related to the Project.

Objection to the overly broad scope of this document request. Notwithstanding, UCC provides a copy of the statement issued by P.B. Dye regarding the golf course and the Project. UCC is not in possession of any other documents related to the Project other than those that were either produced by Buckeye as part of the application or are publicly available.

11. Provide copies of all documents supporting the UCC's claim that the Project may cause a temporary and/or permanent disruption in golf course operations, and may limit access to the property by its members.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents at this time.

12. Provide copies of all documents that relate to wind turbines.

Objection to the overly broad scope of this document request. Notwithstanding, a copy of the UCC's September 25, 2008 comment letter on the Ohio Power Siting Board's draft rules is attached. UCC is not in possession of any other documents related to the Project other than those that were either produced by Buckeye as part of the application or are publicly available.

13. Provide all accounting audit reports, balance sheets, financial statements and annual reports for the past 5 years relating to the UCC.

Objection. The accounting records, financial statements and annual reports of the UCC contain confidential and privileged information that cannot be adequately redacted.

14. Provide copies of all documents supporting the UCC's statement that the Project will likely have adverse effects on the UCC's business and/or market value of the UCC's real property.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents at this time.

15. Provide copies of all documents relating to the "short and long term adverse impact and resulting economic injury to its business.

UCC is not in possession of any such documents at this time.

Respectfully submitted,

Daniel A. Brown (0041132)

Brown Law Office LLC

204 S. Ludlow St., Suite 300

Dayton, Ohio 45402

(937) 224-1216

(937) 224-1217 fax

dbrown@brownlawdayton.com

Attorney for The Urbana Country Club

CERTIFICATION OF DISCOVERY RESPONSES

STATE OF OHIO)	
)	S
COUNTY OF CHAMPAIGN)	

I, Andy Nagle, Clubhouse Manager and authorized representative of The Urbana Country Club, do hereby certify that the responses provided above to the Discovery Requests of Applicant Buckeye Wind, LLC in this matter are true and correct to the best of my knowledge and belief.

Andy Nagle

Sworn to and subscribed before me this 25 day of September, 2009.

Notary Public
My commission expires:

STACEY ANN MEER, Hotary Public in and for the State of Okio Commission Expires 2-19-11

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I caused a true and correct copy of the *UCC's Responses to Buckeye Wind LLC's Discovery Requests* to be served upon all counsel of record listed below, by first-class mail, postage prepaid this 25th day of September, 2009.

Daniel A. Brown

Service List

Stephen Howard, Esq.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
smhoward@vorys.com
Via Electronic Mail and Regular US Mail

Howard Petricoff, Esq.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
Via Electronic Mail

Michael Settineri, Esq.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
mjsettineri@vorys.com
Via Electronic Mail

Larry Gearhardt, Esq.
Chief Legal Counsel
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation
280 North High Street, P.O. Box 182383
Columbus, Ohio 43218-2383
lgearhardt@ofbf.org
Via Electronic Mail and Regular US Mail

Jane A. Napier, Esq.
Assistant Prosecuting Attorney
Champaign County
200 North Main Street
Urbana, Ohio 43078
jancepo@cten.net
Via Electronic Mail and Regular US Mail

Werner Margard, Esq.
Assistant Attorney General
180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us
Via Electronic Mail and Regular US Mail

Anne Hammerstein, Esq.
Assistant Attorney General
180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
anne.hammerstein@puc.state.oh.us
Via Electronic Mail

Christopher A. Walker (0040696)
Van Kley & Walker, LLC
137 North Main Street, Suite 316
Dayton, Ohio 45402
cwalker@vankleywalker.com
Via Electronic Mail and Regular US Mail

Jack A. Van Kley (0016961)
Van Kley & Walker, LLC
132 Northwoods Blvd., Suite C-1
Columbus, Ohio 43235
jvankley@vankleywalker.com
Via Electronic Mail