

FILE

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

10
RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

2009 MAY 15 PM 5:05

PUCO

Case No. 08-888-EL-ORD

In the matter of the Adoption of Rules for)
Alternative and Renewable Energy)
Technologies and Resources, and Emission)
Control Reporting Requirements, and)
Amendment of Chapters 4901:5-1, 4901:5-3,)
4901: 5-5, and 4901:5-7 of the Ohio)
Administrative Code, pursuant to Chapter)
4928, Revised Code, to Implement Senate)
Bill No. 221)

**REQUEST FOR REHEARING
OF THE
THE CITY OF HAMILTON, OHIO**

The City of Hamilton, Ohio respectfully files this request for rehearing of the Commission's final rules adopted on April 15, 2009 in the captioned proceeding. The rules implement SB 221 and address, among other things, energy efficiency and alternative energy resources, renewable energy credits, clean coal technology and environmental regulations. Hamilton appreciates the effort extended by PUCO Staff ("Staff") to develop and issue the rules given the complexity of the subject matter and the aggressive timeframe within which to implement the rules. Hamilton respectfully submits rehearing on two limited but important issues pertaining to hydroelectric facilities.

Hamilton is a home-rule city organized and existing under the Constitution and laws of the State of Ohio and the Hamilton City Charter. The City owns and operates a not-for-profit municipal electric system that includes electric generating facilities, and provides generation, transmission, and distribution services to its retail customers within the City and to certain other customers. Among Hamilton's generation resources are three hydroelectric generating facilities, one of which is currently under development with American Municipal Power - Ohio. Today, approximately 42% of the energy supplied by Hamilton to its customers is generated by hydroelectric facilities. When the new hydroelectric generating facility now being developed comes on line in approximately

**This is to certify that the images appearing are an
accurate and complete reproduction of a case file
document delivered in the regular course of business.**

Technician SM **Date Processed** MAY 18 2009

four years, Hamilton estimates that over 60% of the energy supplied by Hamilton to its customers will be generated from hydroelectric facilities. Granting Hamilton's request for rehearing will ensure that Hamilton's existing hydro facilities are recognized and qualify for participation in the renewable energy credits market, and therefore qualify to assist utilities in meeting the alternative energy portfolio requirements.

A. 4901:1-40-03 should be clarified to include the phrase "qualifying hydroelectric facilities."

Subsection 40-03(A)(2)(a) should be clarified to include "qualifying hydroelectric facilities," which by definition provides that the facility may be located "within or bordering this state or within or bordering an adjacent state" (*see*, the proposed definition of "renewable energy resource" and "hydroelectric facility" set forth in division (A)(35) of section 4928.01 of the Revised Code).

Clarification is necessary because certain hydroelectric facilities owned and operated for the benefit of Ohio citizens are located at locks and dams of the United States Army Corps of Engineers ("USACE") on the Ohio River between the state of Ohio and bordering states. For certain of these projects, the lock is located on the Ohio side of the river, with the hydroelectric facility located on the opposite side of the lock, nominally within the bordering state. The definition of "qualifying hydroelectric facilities" recognizes these circumstances. Accordingly, greater certainty can be accomplished by using the term "qualifying hydroelectric facilities" or using the same language as used in the definition of "qualifying hydroelectric facilities."

B. 4901:1-40-04 should be clarified to ensure that hydroelectric generating facilities are recognized as renewable energy credits, regardless of the "in-service date," consistent with R.C. 4928.65.

Section 40-04 identifies resources that will be recognized as meeting the renewable energy resource benchmarks. Subsection A requires that the resource be placed in service on or after January 1, 1998. For purposes of meeting the renewable energy resource requirement outlined in R.C. 4928.64 (B) (2), electric distribution utilities or electric services companies may use "renewable energy credits" as spelled out

in R.C. 4928.65. However, nothing in R.C. 4928.65 requires that the renewable energy resource be in place on or after January 1, 1998. Hamilton respectfully submits that Staff may have misapprehended the legislative intent by including an in service date for a "renewable energy resource," thus improperly eliminating certain hydroelectric generating facilities from qualifying as renewable energy credits.

Staff may have included the 1998 "in service" date in Subsection A because R.C. 4928.64 requires that a renewable energy resource be in service before January 1, 1998, in order to be considered an "alternative energy resource." However, "alternative energy resource" should not be interchanged with "renewable energy resource." Nothing in R.C. 4928.65 requires that a renewable energy resource be an "alternative energy resource" as defined in R.C. 4928.64. Therefore, the 1998 deadline (in R.C. 4928.64) seemingly does not apply to R.C. 4928.65.

Hamilton asserts that the legislative intent behind R.C. 4928.65 was for all designated alternative energy processes to qualify as sources to meet alternative energy benchmarks. An amendment was added (to R.C. 4928.65) during the legislative process to specifically include a "hydroelectric generating facility" as a qualified resource. That language defined a "hydroelectric generating facility" as a facility "located at a dam on a river, or on any water discharged to a river, that is within or bordering this state or within or bordering an adjoining state." This language does not include any date limitation or restriction, and its absence must be given significance.

The legislative intent is further clarified later in R.C. 4928.65, where it states that the system of registering RECs "shall allow a hydroelectric generating facility to be eligible for obtaining renewable energy credits." Recognizing hydroelectric resources placed in service prior to January 1, 1998 is not only consistent with the legislative intent, it serves the public interest by making renewable energy credits available to utilities as they strive to meet their renewable energy resource requirements. Hamilton therefore requests that the requirement that the resource be in service on or after January 1, 1998 be removed from this provision.

CONCLUSION

For the foregoing reasons, Hamilton respectfully requests that the Commission grant its request for rehearing on the identified issues in the proposed final rules.

Respectfully submitted this 15th day of May, 2009.

 ^{MSW}

Charles S. Young
Deputy City Manager
City of Hamilton
345 High Street
Hamilton, Ohio 45011
(513) 785-7003 office
(513) 785-7010 fax
younge@ci.hamilton.oh.us

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing Request for Rehearing of The City of Hamilton, Ohio was served via by first-class, postage prepaid U.S. mail, and, where indicated, electronic on this 15th day of May, 2009 upon the following:

SEE ATTACHED LIST

Charles Young ^{MSW}
Attorney at Law

SERVICE LIST

Kenneth R. Alfred, Executive Director
Ohio Fuel Cell Coalition
737 Bolivar Road
Cleveland, OH 44115

Langdon D. Bell
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215
Lbell33@aol.com
Attorney for Norton Energy Storage

Mary W. Christensen
Christensen Christensen Donchatz
Kettlewell & Owens, LLP
100 East Campus View Blvd., Suite 360
Columbus, OH 43235
mchristensen@columbuslaw.org
Attorney for Great Lakes Energy Development
Task Force

Dale R. Arnold, Director, Energy Services
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation
280 North High St.
P.O. Box 182383
Columbus, OH 43218
darnold@ofbf.org

David Caldwell, Legislative Coordinator
United Steelworkers, District 1
777 Dearborn Park Lane - J
Columbus, OH 43085

Joseph M. Clark
Lisa G. McAlister
McNees Wallace & Nurick, LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
jclark@mwncmh.com
lmcalister@mwncmh.com
Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Paul A. Colbert, Associate General Counsel
Elizabeth H. Watts, Assistant General Counsel
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo, Senior Counsel
Amy B. Spiller, Associate General Counsel
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.
139 East Fourth Street
P.O. Box 960
Cincinnati, OH 45201

Mark S. Fleiner, President
Rolls-Royce Fuel Cell Systems, Inc.
6065 Ship Avenue NW
North Canton, OH 44720

Amy Gomborg, Program Director
Environment Ohio
203 East Broad Street, Ste 3
Columbus, OH 43215

Mark A. Hayden
Firstenergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com
Attorney for Ohio Edison Company, the
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and
the Toledo Edison Company

Chester Jourdan, Jr., Executive Director
Erin Miller, Director, Center for Energy &
Environment
Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission
111 Library Street, Suite 100
Columbus, OH 43215
emiller@morpc.org

Christine M. Falco
PJM Interconnection, LLC
965 Jefferson Avenue
Norristown, PA 19403
falcoc@pjm.com

P. Flem, President
Retco Molded Products
4425 Appleton St.
Cincinnati, OH 45209

Gary S. Guzy, General Counsel
John Melby, President
APX, Inc.
5201 Great America Parkway #522
Santa Clara, CA 95054
gguzy@apx.com
jmelby@apx.com

Jon A. Husted
Speaker, Ohio House of Representatives
77 South High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
District37@ohr.state.oh.us

Rodger A. Kershner
Howard & Howard Attorneys PC
39400 Woodward Avenue, Suite 100
Bloomfield Hills, MI 48304
rak@h2law.com
Attorney for LS Power Associates, LP

Joseph P. Koncelik
Frantz Ward LLP
2500 Key Center
127 Public Square
Cleveland, OH 44114
jkoncelik@frantzward.com
Attorney for Vertus Technologies Industrial, LLC

Steve Lankenau
American Ag Fuels
815 Greenler Street
Defiance, OH 43512

Michael K. Lavanga
Garrett A. Stone
Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.
8th Floor, West Tower
Washington D.C. 20007
mkl@bbrslaw.com
gas@bbrslaw.com
Attorneys for Nucor Steel Marion, Inc.

David Marchese
Haddington Ventures, LLC
2603 Augusta, Suite 900
Houston, TX 77057

Steve Millard, President and Executive Director
The Council of Smaller Enterprises
The Higbee Building
100 Public Square, Suite 210
Cleveland, OH 44113

Michael L. Kurtz
David F. Boehm
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
dboehm@BLKlawfirm.com
Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group

Connie L. Lausten
New Generation Biofuels
4308 Brandywine St. NW
Washington, D.C. 20016
cllausten@newgenerationbiofuels.com

Dwight N. Lockwood, Group Vice President
Global Energy, Inc.
312 Walnut Street, Suite 2300
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dnlockwood@globalenergyinc.com

Ann McCabe, Midwest Regional Director
The Climate Registry
1543 W. School St
Chicago, IL 60657
ann@theclimateregistry.org

Jennifer Miller, Conservation Program Coordinator
Sierra Club Ohio Chapter
131 N. High St., Ste 605
Columbus, OH 43215

Nolan Moser
Trent A. Dougherty
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212
nmoser@theOEC.org
tdougherty@theOEC.org

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler, LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215
tobrien@bricker.com
Attorneys for Northeast Ohio Public Energy
Council

Vincent A. Parisi
5020 Bradenton Ave.
Dublin, OH 43017
vparisi@igsenergy.com
Attorney for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

Barth E. Royer
Bell & Royer Co., LPA
33 South Grant Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215
BarthRoyer@aol.com
Attorney for Ohio Environmental Council

Kenneth D. Schisler
EnerNOC, Inc.
75 Federal St., Suite 300
Boston, MA 02110
kschisler@enernoc.com

Steven T. Nourse
Marvin I. Resnik
American Electric Power Service Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
stnourse@aep.com
miresnick@aep.com
Attorneys for Columbus Southern Power
Company and Ohio Power Company

Terrence O'Donnell
Sally W. Bloomfield
Matthew W. Warnock
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
todonnell@bricker.com
sbloomfield@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com
Attorneys for the American Wind Energy
Association, Ohio Advanced Energy, Wind on the
Wires, and Environment Ohio

M. Howard Petricoff
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay St.
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
Attorney for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.,
Direct Energy Services, LLC, and Integrus
Energy Services, Inc.

Neil Sater, CEO
Greenfield Steam & Electric
6618 Morningside Drive
Brecksville, OH 44141

Linda Sekura
Conservation Committee Chan-
Northeast Ohio Sierra Club
20508 Watson Road
Maple Heights, OH 44137
LSekura@aol.com

Jeffrey L. Small, Counsel of Record
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 W. Broad St., Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215
small@occ.state.oh.us

Robert J. Triozzi
Steven L. Beeler
City of Cleveland
Cleveland City Hall
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 206
Cleveland, OH 44114
RTriozzi@city.cleveland.oh.us
SBeeler@city.cleveland.oh.us
Attorneys for the City of Cleveland

John W. Bentine
Matthew S. White
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 E. State St., Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jbentine@cwsllaw.com
mwhite@cwsllaw.com

Judi L. Sobecki
Randall V. Griffin
Dayton Power and Light Company
1065 Woodman Dr.
Dayton, OH 45432
judi.sobecki@DPLinc.com
randall.griffin@DPLinc.com

Mark A. Whitt
Andrew J. Campbell
Jones Day
325 John H. McConnell Blvd, Suite 600
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus, OH 43216
mawhitt@jonesday.com
ajcampbell@jonesday.com
Attorneys for East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a
Dominion East Ohio

Thomas E. Lodge
Carolyn S. Flahive
Kurt P. Helfrich
Sarah P. Chambers
Thompson Hine LLP
41 South High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, Ohio 43215-6101
Carolyn.Flahive@thompsonhine.com
Attorneys for Buckeye Power, Inc.

ND: 4817-6468-8131, v. I