5PM FARUKI IRELAND & COX

NO.062 P.2/9

JAN. 8.2009 12:25PM FAX

RECEIVED BOO 2009 JAN -8 PM PUCO

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan	: : :	Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSQ
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs		Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code Section 4905.13		Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Amended Corporate Separation Plan	: : :	Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC

## MEMORANDUM OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY IN OPPOSITION TO MOTION TO INTERVENE AND REQUEST FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION TO INTERVENE OUT OF TIME OF THE EDGEMONT NEIGHBORHOOD COALITION

The Commission should not allow a latecomer to intervene a month after the deadline. Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-11(E) provides that "[a] motion to intervene will not be considered timely if it is filed later than . . . any specific deadline established by order of the commission for purposes of a particular proceeding." The Code further mandates that "[a] motion to intervene which is not timely will be granted only under extraordinary circumstances." Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-11(F). There are no such extraordinary circumstances here. The fact that Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition ("Edgemont") was "unaware of the November 26, 2008 entry" setting December 10, 2008 as the deadline for motions to intervene does not constitute an extraordinary circumstance. Motion to Intervene ("Motion"), p. 2.

RECEIVED-BOCKETING BIV

PH I:

Edgemont's Motion, filed January 7, 2009, comes almost a full month after the December 10, 2008 deadline to intervene set by the Commission. Contrary to Edgemont's assertion that "the proceeding has just commenced," this matter, which is on a compressed schedule, was commenced on October 10, 2008 -- nearly three months ago. The evidentiary hearing begins in less than three weeks (18 days from the date of this filing).

Further, Edgemont's interest in this matter is adequately represented by other intervenors, most notably the Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy ("OPAE") and the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counseli("OCC"). Indeed, Edgemont's goal that "rates paid by oustomers be reasonable, that service be adequate," and that the adopted measures are "effective and consistent" with SB 221, are the goals of all of the intervenors to this action. Edgemont describes itself as a "community organization representing low-income rate payers in the largest urban area in the DP&L territory" and provides bill counseling and home weatherization assistance. Motion, pp. 1-2. These interests completely align with the interests of another intervenor, OPAE, who is "charged with advocating for low-income residents[.]" OPAE Motion to Intervene, pp. 2-3. Like Edgemont, OPAE "also provides essential services in the form of bill payment assistance programs and weatherization" assistance to low-income residents. In addition to OPAE, the OCC has been aggressivily advocating on behalf of all residential consumers of electricity within DP&L's service territory. Accordingly, the interests of Edgemont are more than adequately represented in this proceeding.

Finally, as to the late-filing intervenors that Edgemont references (Motion, p. 2) in the recent Duke ESP filing (Case No. 09-920-EL-SSO), the circumstances surrounding the intervention in that case materially differ from the circumstances here. In the Duke case, the intervenors at issue ("Comercial Group") filed their motion to intervene only five days after the

2

NO.062 P.4/9

deadline, and 63 days before Duke's evidentiary hearing - not a month after the deadline and 19 days before the evidentiary hearing, which Edgemont attempts to do here.

Allowing additional intervenors at this late stage is prejudicial to DP&L as it

diligently prepares for the upcoming depositions and hearing. Edgemont has failed to establish the "extraordinary circumstances" required to justify its attempt to enter the proceedings at this point, and the Commission should deny Edgemont's Motion as untimely.

Respectfully submitted,

Judi L. Sobecki (0067186) THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY 1065 Woodman Drive Dayton, OH 45432 Telephone: (937) 259-7171 Telecopier: (937) 259-7178 Email: judi.sobecki@dpline.com

Charles J. Faruki (2010417) Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892) FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L. 500 Courthouse Plaza, S.W. 10 North Ludlow Street Dayton, OH 45402 Telephone: (937) 227-3705 Telecopier: (937) 227-3717 Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Memorandum of The Dayton Power and

Light Company in Opposition to the Motion to Intervene and Request for Leave to File Motion

to Intervene Out of Time of The Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition has been served via

electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 8th day of January, 2009:

Samuel C, Randazzo, Èsq. Lisa G. McAlister, Esq. Joseph M. Clark, Esq. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215:4228

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

John W. Bentine, Esq. Matthew S. White, Esq. Mark S. Yurick, Esq. CHESTER WILLCOX & SAXBE LLP 65 East State Street, Suite 1000 Columbus, OH 43215

Attorneys for The Kroger Company

Jacqueline L. Roberts, Esq. Michael E. Idzkowski, Esq. Richard Reese, Esq. Gregory J. Poulos, Esq. OFFICE OF OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215

David Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202-4454

Attorney for Ohio Energy Group, Inc.

David C. Rinebolt, Esq. Colleen L. Mooney, Esq. OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY 231 West Lima Street Findlay, OH 45839-1793

M. Howard Petricoff, Esq. Stephen M. Howard, Esq. Michael J. Settineri, Esq. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Cynthia A. Fonner, Esq. Senior Counsel CONSTELLATION ENERGY RESOURCES, LLC 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661

Attorneys for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc.

David I. Fein Vice President, Energy Policy - Midwest CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP, INC. 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661

Tasha Hamilton Manager, Energy Policy CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP, INC. 111 Market Place, Suite 600 Baltimore, MD 21202

Henry Eckhart, Esq. 50 West Broad Street, Suite 2117 Columbus, OH 43215-3301

Robert Ukeiley, Esq. LAW OFFICE OF ROBERT UKEILEY 435R Chestnut Street, Suite 1 Berea, KY 40403

Attorneys for Sierra Club Ohio Chapter

5

Ned Ford 539 Plattner Trail Beavercreek, OH 45430

Richard L. Sites, Esq. General Counsel and Senior Director of Health Policy Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620

Attorney for The Ohio Hospital Association

Craig I. Smith, Esq. Attorney at Law 2824 Coventry Road Cleveland, OH 44120

Attorney for Cargill, Incorporated

Larry Gearhardt, Esq. Chief Legal Counsel OHIO FARM BUREAU FEDERATION 280 North High Street P.O. Box 182383 Columbus, OH 43218-2383

Attorney for The Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

Thomas J. O'Brien, Esq. BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Attorney for The Ohio Manufacturers' Association

Patrick Bonfield, Esq. John Danish, Esq. Christopher L. Miller, Esq. Gregory H. Dunn, Esq. Andre T. Porter, Esq. SCHOTTENSTEIN ZOX & DUNN CO., LPA 250 West Street Columbus, OH 43215

Attorneys for The City of Dayton

M. Howard Petricoff, Esq. Stephen M. Howard, Esq. Michael J. Settineri, Esq. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008

Attorneys for Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

Barth E. Royer, Esq. BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Gary A. Jeffries, Esq. Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

Attomeys for Dominion Retail, Inc.

Barth E. Royer, Esq. BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927

Nolan Moser, Esq. Air & Energy Program Manager The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449 Trent A. Dougherty, Esq. The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449

Todd Williams, Esq. 4534 Douglas Road Toledo, OH 43613

Attorneys for The Ohio Environmental Council

Ellis Jacobs Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. 333 West First Street, Suite 500B Dayton, OH 45402

Attorney for The Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Thomas Lindgren, Esq. Thomas McNamee, Esq. Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215

Office of the Ohio Attorney General

Sharkey

203855.1