FILE

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

2008 SEP -8 PM 4: 31

## BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

PUCO

In the Matter of:
The Application of American Transmission
Systems, Incorporated and The Cleveland
Electric Illuminating Company for a
Certificate of Environmental Compatibility
and Public Need for the Geauga County
138 kV Transmission Line Supply Project

)
Case No. 07-0171-EL-BTX
Case No. 07-0171-EL-BTX
)

## **INITIAL DIRECT TESTIMONY OF**

## RANDOLPH H. BENNETT

ON BEHALF OF

CITIZENS ADVOCATING RESPONSIBLE ENERGY

- Q. Please state your name and address.
- 2 A. Randolph Harvey Bennett. My address is 11680 Clay Street, Huntsburg,
- 3 Ohio, 44046.
- 4 Q. How long have you lived at this address?
- 5 A. 21 years.
- 6 Q. Do you own any other property in Geauga County?
- 7 A. Yes. I own a parcel of property to the south of my residence on Clay
- 8 Street, as well as a single family rental property in Chardon, and the
- 9 building where I operate my business in Chardon.
- 10 Q. Have you resided in Geauga County your whole life?
- 11 A. I have lived in Geauga County since I was 5 years old.
- 12 Q. How will your property on Clay Street be affected by construction of the
- 13 proposed transmission line along Clay Street?
- 14 A. If constructed, the proposed line will have a negative aesthetic impact on
- the area. My wife and I moved from Chardon in 1987 because we liked
- 16 the rural setting in Huntsburg. We wanted property with a barn, pond, and
- 17 trees to raise horses for our children so they could get involved in 4H. The
- proposed transmission line will require clear-cutting a right-of-way of 62
- 19 feet from the road centerline including those trees outside the right-of-way
- capable of interfering. The removal of trees and vegetation, and the
- 21 placement of transmission lines and poles, will adversely affect the beauty
- 22 and aesthetics of all property on both sides of the street in three
- 23 townships.

24	Q.	Are there trees and vegetation on your property that would have to be
25		removed if the electrical transmission line is constructed along Clay
26		Street?
27	A.	Yes. I have trees along the road edge of both of my properties that will fall
28		within the right-of-way, thus requiring their removal. Some are pines that
29		are replanted live Christmas trees. Another is a white oak that was
30		brought from a former residence in Chardon as a seedling. The trees
31		along the road edge are mostly maple, oak and poplar. Removal of these
32		trees will leave the east side of my horse pasture open to the road with no
33		barrier other than a wire fence.
34	Q.	Are there utility poles on Clay Street now?
35	A.	Yes. These poles are on the opposite side of the street from my land.
36	Q.	What other impacts would occur if the electrical transmission line were
37		constructed along the Clay Street Route?
38	A.	Removal of the trees and vegetation would not only ruin the beauty and
39		aesthetics of the surrounding properties, but it would also have an adverse
40		environmental impact. I have been planting trees for additional shade and
41		wind breaks. Any decrease of vegetation will increase erosion and
42		drainage problems.
43	Q.	What other impacts would occur if the electrical transmission line were
44		constructed along the Clay Street Route?
45	A.	I believe there would be a decrease in the property values. Having a

barren, clear-cut right-of-way within feet of the front of houses lessens the

2

{K0445621.1}

46

beauty of the properties and will lessen the curb-appeal to prospective buyers. Add to this the growing public perception that power lines are dangerous because of electromagnetic fields. Recent national news regarding the use of cell phones is just one example. These factors will most likely result in a reduction in property values and a lengthening of the amount of time in takes to sell a piece of property along the transmission line route.

Q. What other impacts would occur if the electrical transmission line were constructed along the Clay Street Route?

There is also a safety issue that is created by constructing the transmission along Clay Street. Because Clay Street is a narrow country road, the poles are usually set only 30 feet from the road centerline. This is particularly dangerous and there is the possibility for an errant vehicle to collide with a utility pole and disrupt the lines. Most utility corridors are built away from vehicle traffic to minimize this risk. The construction of transmission lines in a residential area also increases the risk of tingle voltage shocks and step voltage to animals and humans. Testimony at the Thompson Public Hearing from heating contractor Richard Rucinski spoke of shocks received from his truck. In addition, FirstEnergy's website states: "Parking within or adjacent to the right-of-way may induce an electric charge on the vehicle. Induced charges may also be imposed on objects such as fences, signs, or any other conductive object". Any residents with school age children who wait for buses will have them

{K0445521.1} 3

A.

70		standing at the end of their driveways under 138,000 volt lines. In the
71		winter there is the chance for pole contamination with road salt spray
72		causing a pole fire. News Channel 5 reported just such an incident on
73		January 26, 2000 as did the Hudson City Manager's Report on May 18,
74		2007. To place this transmission line in close proximity to Geauga Count
75		residents working or playing in their yards does not make good sense.
76	Q.	What other impacts would occur if the electrical transmission line were
77		constructed along the Clay Street Route?
78	A.	The current application under review lists that there are six homes that wi
79		have to be relocated or destroyed because they fall within the path of the
80		transmission line right-of-way. This will significantly disrupt those families'
81		lives. I have personally spoken to and helped measure houses on Clay
82		Street that are less than five feet beyond the 30 foot right-of-way. With
83		wires 49 feet from the ground next to a two-story home 30-35 feet away,
84		the distance closes to 45-50 feet.
85	Q.	Do you consider Clay Street an existing civil corridor suitable for
86		construction of a 138 kV electrical transmission line?
87	A.	No. Clay Street is a rural, narrow country road with residences close to
88		the road, and for these reasons, it is not suitable for construction of a 138
89		kV electrical transmission line.
90	Q.	If the line were constructed along the route identified in the application as

the Preferred Route, would your concerns be eliminated?

{K0445521.1}

91

- 92 A. No. The intrusion of a new electric utility corridor in Geauga County is
  93 going to have an impact on all of the properties in the county. Geauga
  94 County is a rural county with a small-town atmosphere. People move to
  95 Geauga County for the peace and quiet, and to distance themselves from
  96 urban developments and construction. Part of this rural character and
  97 country environment will be lost if a new utility corridor is constructed.
- 98 Q. Is there anything else you would like to add?
- 99 A. Not at this time.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing Citizens Advocating Responsible Energy's Initial Direct Testimony of Randall H. Bennett was served this 8<sup>th</sup> day of September 2008, via regular U.S. Mail upon the following:

Thomas Lindgren
Thomas McNamee
Office of the Attorney General of Ohio
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

Janet Stoneking
Administrative Law Judge
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

Christopher Schraff Robert J. Schmidt, Jr. Porter Wright Morris & Arthur 41 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 James O'Dell Ohio Power Siting Board 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

David Ondrey Todd Hicks Thrasher Dinsmore & Dolan 100 Seventh Avenue, Suite 150 Chardon, Ohio 44024 Sally W. Bloomfield Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291

Robert J. Hanna Matthew S. Romano Tucker Ellis & West LLP 1150 Huntington Building 925 Euclid Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44115-1414

James Gillette Law Director City of Chardon, Ohio Chardon Municipal Center 111 Water Street Chardon, Ohio 44024-1238

Daniel J. Neilsen McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 21 E. State Street, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-4281

David L. McCombs 100 Public Square P.O. Box 217 Andover, Ohio 44003-0217

Julie A. Crocker