# FILE

#### **BEFORE** THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

	PRECEIVE.
	FORE S COMMISSION OF OHIO
In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Authority to Increase Rates for its Gas Distribution Service.	FORE S COMMISSION OF OHIO  Case No. 07-829-GA-AIR  PRECEINED DOCKET INFO DOCKE
In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of an Alternative Rate Plan for its Gas Distribution Service.	) Case No. 07-830-GA-ALT )
In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval to Change Accounting Methods.	) Case No. 07-831-GA-AAM )
In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to Recover Certain Costs Associated with a Pipeline Infrastructure Replacement Program Through an Automatic Adjustment Clause, And for Certain Accounting Treatment.	) ) Case No. 08-169-GA-ALT ) ) )
In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to Recover Certain Costs Associated with a Automated Meter Reading Deployment through an Automatic Adjustment Clause, And for Certain Accounting Treatment.	) ) Case No. 06-1453-UNC ) )

### MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER REGARDING THE EXHIBITS TO THE DEPOSITION TRANSCRIPT OF WILLIAM ARMSTRONG THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24, the Office of the Ohio Consumers'

Counsel ("OCC") hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission ("PUCO" or

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business. Technician BIM \_Date Processed\_

"Commission") for a protective order regarding certain information asserted to be confidential by East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio ("DEO" or "the Company"). As part of discovery in these proceedings, DEO provided information to OCC (subject to a protective agreement) and asserted that non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of R.C. Title 49. Some of that information was used in OCC's deposition of William Armstrong that was held on June 17, 2008.

Contemporaneously with the filing of this Motion, OCC is submitting transcribed depositions of various Company witnesses in this proceeding, including Mr. Armstrong. The deposition transcript of Mr. Armstrong contains information that was obtained by OCC pursuant to its protective agreement with DEO that is redacted from the publicly filed version. OCC requests that the Commission issue such order as is necessary to protect the information redacted from the deposition transcript, subject to the resolution of this case and the OCC's rights under its protective agreement with DEO.

By this Motion, OCC does not concede that the information does indeed contain trade secrets or should otherwise be withheld from public inspection. However, OCC has obtained this information pursuant to a protective agreement with DEO that provides for such information to be treated under a protected status (i.e. protected subject to OCC's right under the protective agreement to initiate a process for review regarding whether the information deserves confidential treatment under Ohio law).

The grounds for this Motion are more fully described in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Joseph Berio, Counsel of Record

Larry S. Sauer Gregory J. Poulos

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

#### Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 614-466-8574 (Telephone) serio@occ.state.oh.us sauer@occ.state.oh.us poulos@occ.state.oh.us

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Authority to Increase Rates for its Gas Distribution Service.	) ) )	Case No. 07-829-GA-AIR
In the Matter of the Application of the East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion	)	Case No. 07-830-GA-ALT
East Ohio for Approval of an Alternative	ĺ	
Rate Plan for its Gas Distribution Service.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of the	)	
East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion	)	Case No. 07-831-GA-AAM
East Ohio for Approval to Change	)	
Accounting Methods.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of the	)	*
East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion	)	
East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to	)	Case No. 08-169-GA-ALT
Recover Certain Costs Associated with a	)	
Pipeline Infrastructure Replacement	)	
Program Through an Automatic	)	,
Adjustment Clause, And for Certain	)	
Accounting Treatment.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of the	)	
East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion	ĺ	
East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to	)	Case No. 06-1453-UNC
Recover Certain Costs Associated with a	)	
Automated Meter Reading Deployment	)	
through an Automatic Adjustment Clause,	)	•
And for Certain Accounting Treatment.	)	

#### **MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

Contemporaneously with the filing of this Motion, OCC is filing the depositions of various Company witnesses including Mr. Armstrong. The deposition transcript of Mr. Armstrong contains information obtained in discovery subject to OCC's protective

agreement with DEO. Documents labeled "Public Version Redacted" are being filed for view by the public. The Public Version of the deposition transcript reflects the redaction of information that may be considered confidential by the Company. The final treatment of some of this information remains in controversy, both because the period for revised redaction of documents (as required by the Order) has not yet run and because the treatment of the information is a subject of the Company's Rate Case Application.

Without conceding that the information obtained in these proceedings from the Company under claims of confidentiality meet the standard for trade secrets and deserve protection from public revelation under R.C. 1333.61(D), the OCC files the instant Motion under the workings of the PUCO's rules to protect the information pending a determination at a later point in time regarding the appropriate treatment of the information under Ohio law. Accordingly, OCC hereby requests that the Commission issue such order as is necessary to protect the redacted portions of Mr. Armstrong's deposition transcript subject to the resolution of this case and the OCC's rights under its protective agreement with DEO.

OCC understands that the Company considers the information redacted in the deposition transcript to be confidential and deserving of the status of trade secrets as defined in R.C. 1333.61(D). Such assertions would be based on claims by DEO that the information (1) derives economic value, actual or potential, from not being known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by others, and (2) is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy. Under the assertions made by DEO, confidential treatment of the documents and the information that OCC seeks to use from those documents would be appropriate, subject to the OCC's rights

under the protective agreement with DEO to initiate a review process regarding whether the information qualifies for protection.

For the foregoing reasons and subject to the foregoing reservations of rights, this Motion for Protective Order should be granted.

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Joseph P. Serio, Counsel of Record

Larry S. Sauer Gregory J. Poulos

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 614-466-8574 (Telephone)

serio@occ.state.oh.us sauer@occ.state.oh.us

poulos@occ.state.oh.us

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion for Protective Order of the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel was by first class United States Mail, postage prepaid, to the persons listed below, on this 29<sup>th</sup> day of July 2008.

oseph P. Serio

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Stephen Reilly
Anne Hammerstein
Attorney General's Office
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215

David A. Kutik
Dominion East Ohio
Jones Day
North Point, 901 Lakeside Ave.
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-1190

Barth E. Royer Dominion Retail, Inc. Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3900 Mark A. Whitt Andrew J. Campbell Dominion East Ohio Jones Day P.O Box 165017 Columbus, Ohio 43216-5017

John W. Bentine Mark S. Yurick Interstate Gas Supply Chester, Willcox & Saxbe LLP 65 East State St., Ste. 1000 Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen Howard
Integrys Energy Services, Inc.
Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease LLP
52 East Gay St., P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

Joseph P. Meissner Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West Sixth Street Cleveland, Ohio 44113

John M. Dosker General Counsel Stand Energy Corporation 1077 Celestial St., Ste. 110 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202-1629

Todd M. Smith
Utility Workers Union Of America
Local G555
Schwarzwald & McNAir LLP
616 Penton Media Building
1300 East Ninth Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114

W. Jonathan Airey Gregory D. Russell Ohio Oil & Gas Association Vorys, Sater, Seymour &Pease LLP 52 East Gay St., P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008 David Rinebolt Colleen Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy P.O. Box 1793 Findlay, Ohio 45839-1793

Stephen M. Howard Ohio Gas Marketers Group Vorys, Sater, Seymour &Pease LLP 52 East Gay St., P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

David F. Boehm Michael L. Kurtz Ohio Energy Group Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202

Robert J. Triozzi
Julianne Kurdila
Steven Beeler
City of Cleveland
601 Lakeside Ave Room 106
Cleveland OH 44114-1077