FILE

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

TOP SUN 30 PH 3: 17

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Authority to Increase Rates for its Gas Distribution Service.

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of an Alternative Rate Plan for its Gas Distribution Service

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval to Change Accounting Methods

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to Recover Certain Costs Associated with a Pipeline Infrastructure Replacement Program Through an Automatic Adjustment Clause, And for Certain Accounting Treatment

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of Tariffs to Recover Certain Costs Associated with Automated Meter Reading Deployment Through an Automatic Adjustment Clause, and for Certain Accounting Treatment

Case No. 07-829-GA-AIR

Case No. 07-830-GA-ALT

Case No. 07-831-GA-AAM

Case No. 08-169-GA-ALT

Case No. 06-1453-GA-UNC

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER BY THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL ON BEHALF OF THE EAST OHIO GAS COMPANY D/B/A DOMINION EAST OHIO

| Chis 1s              | to c | rtify  | that  | the  | image  | e apr  | pear       | ing  | are      | an                                     |
|----------------------|------|--------|-------|------|--------|--------|------------|------|----------|--|
| accurate<br>locument | and  | comple | ote r | epro | lustic | or of  | <b>a</b> ( | 4.50 | file     | i<br>Aba                               |
| locument             | GeT: | _      | IR C  | DA T | -Aaren | L COUL | L D T      | O. 1 | 2011     | ************************************** |
| Pechnici             | an   |        |       | 1    | Date 1 | Proce  | ssed       | ععد  | <u> </u> | <u> 25.</u>                            |

#### I. INTRODUCTION

Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-12, Ohio Administrative Code, The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio ("DEO") submits its Memorandum in Support of the Motion for Protective Order by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC"). On June 23, OCC filed, among other things, public and confidential versions of the pre-filed testimony of witness Trevor Roycroft along with a Motion for Protective Order related to his testimony. DEO requests that the Commission grant OCC's Motion for the reasons that follow.

#### IL ARGUMENT

# A. The Information Contained in OCC's Filing Deserves Protective Treatment.

The Commission has provided in its rules that on the motion of any party it "may issue any order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in [a filed] document, to the extent that state or federal law prohibits release of the information, including where the information is deemed by the commission . . . to constitute a trade secret under Ohio law." Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-24(D). Section 1333.61(D) of the Revised Code defines "trade secret" as follows:

"Trade secret" means information, including . . . any business information or plans . . . [or] financial information . . . that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.
- (2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

The information contained in OCC's filing satisfies these standards.

The information redacted from the testimony of Trevor Roycroft consists of a business case and presentation developed in conjunction with DEO's proposed automated meter reading

COI-1402291 2

("AMR") program. These documents contain proprietary information concerning certain costs to DEO that would potentially be valuable to parties with whom DEO does business or must negotiate. This satisfies the requirement of R.C. 1333.61(D)(1) that the information "derive[] independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use." In satisfaction of R.C. 1333.61(D)(2), DEO has taken reasonable efforts to maintain the confidentiality of this information, both by limiting internal access to this information and by asserting the confidentiality of this information in the course of these proceedings. Non-disclosure of this information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code.

### III. CONCLUSION

For the reasons discussed above, DEO respectfully requests that the Commission grant OCC's Motion for Protective Order.

Respectfully submitted,

David A. Kutik

JONES DAY

North Point, 901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, Ohio 44114

Telephone: (216) 586-3939 Facsimile: (216) 579-0212 dakutik@jonesday.com

Mark A. Whitt (Counsel of Record)

Andrew J. Campbell

JONES DAY

325 John H. McConnell Blvd., Suite 600

P. O. Box 165017

Columbus, Ohio 43216-5017

Telephone: (614) 469-3939

Facsimile: (614) 461-4198 mawhitt@jonesday.com ajcampbell@jonesday.com

ATTORNEYS FOR THE EAST OHIO GAS COMPANY D/B/A DOMINION EAST OHIO

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Memorandum in Support of the Motion for Protective Order by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio was sent by electronic mail to the following parties on this 30th day of June, 2008.

Andrew J. Campbell

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.
John Bentine, Esq.
Mark Yurick, Esq.
Chester, Wilcox & Saxbe LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215-4213
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com

The Neighborhood Environmental Coalition, The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland, The Cleveland Housing Network, and The Consumers for Fair Utility Rates Joseph Meissner, Esq.
The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West 6th Street Cleveland, OH 44113 jpmeissn@lasclev.org

Office of the Ohio Consumers Counsel Joseph Serio, Esq. 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215-3485 serio@occ.state.oh.us

Ohio Energy Group David Boehm, Esq. 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202 dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy David Rinebolt, Esq. P.O. Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45839-1793 drinebolt@aol.com Dominion Retail Barth E. Royer 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

Industrial Energy Users-Ohio Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq. McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 sam@mwncmh.com Stand Energy Corporation
John M. Dosker, Esq.
General Counsel
1077 Celestial Street, Suite 110
Cincinnati, OH 45202-1629
jdosker@stand-energy.com

UWUA Local G555
Todd M. Smith, Esq.
Schwarzwald & McNair LLP
616 Penton Media Building
1300 East Ninth Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
tsmith@smcnlaw.com

The Ohio Oil & Gas Association
W. Jonathan Airey
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
wjairey@vssp.com

Stephen Reilly
Anne Hammerstein
Office of the Ohio Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
stephen.reilly@puc.state.oh.us
anne.hammerstein@puc.state.oh.us

Integrys Energy Services, Inc.
M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE
LLP
52 East Gay Street
P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com

Roberta Triozzi
City of Cleveland
Cleveland City Hall
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 206
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-1077
RTriozzi@city.cleveland.oh.us