

FILE

4

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

08-607-GA-CSS



The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

2008 JUN -5 PM 2: 05

CGRU040208Y8
Case Number

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Attn: Docketing
180 E. Broad St.
Columbus, OH 43215

PUCO

Formal Complaint Form

MAK Motel Inc.
Customer Name

13701 Broadway Avenue
Customer Address

Cleveland OH 44125
City State Zip

Against

0 5000 0534 5899
Account Number

Customer Service Address (if different from above)

Dominion East Ohio Gas Company
Utility Company Name

Cleveland OH 44103
City State Zip

Please describe your complaint. (Attach additional sheets if necessary)

MAK Motel, Inc., doing business as Eldorado Motel, is a 42-room, one-story motel, with two almost identical wings, one with 22 rooms, the other with 20 rooms. The two wings are each serviced with its own gas meter and have separate gas accounts. The gas bills for the two wings have been comparable until a two to three month period between December 2007 and March 2008, when the meter readings for one motel wing reported apparent gas usage of more than ten times higher than the rate of consumption for at least the previous two years. The Dominion East Ohio technician found the boiler off (it had been shut off for at least the last two heating seasons), and no leaks in the piping. The only gas appliances are two water heaters, the same as serves the other wing of the motel. Occupancy in the two wings of the motel is comparable, as is the water consumption and electricity usage. There is no reasonable explanation for a quantum jump in gas usage.

The only logical explanation is that the meter either malfunctioned or was tampered with. A test of the meter apparently rules out the former explanation, but not the later. MAK is requesting that the gas bills for the three months in question be determined by a historical average or based on the usage of the second gas meter.

Signature Charles Gruenspan, Attorney for MAK Motel, Inc.

(216) 581-3333 MAK (216) 595-6300 Gruenspan

Customer Telephone Number

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Ted Strickland, Governor • Alan R. Schriber, Chairman

180 E. Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793 • An Equal Opportunity Employer and Service Provider

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business

Technician _____ Date Processed 6-5-08

Charles Gruenspan Co., L.P.A.

805 THREE COMMERCE PARK SQUARE
23230 CHAGRIN BOULEVARD
CLEVELAND, OHIO 44122
cgruenspanlpa@gmail.com
FACSIMILE (216) 595-6307
TELEPHONE (216) 595-6300

FACSIMILE COVER PAGE

To: Cindi Mack	From: Charles Gruenspan
Fax #: 1614-995-2008	Fax #:
Company:	Tel #:
Subject: MAK Motel Case No. CGRU040208Y8	
Sent: 5/6/2008 at 2:42:38 PM	Pages: 21 (including cover)

Attached are monthly usage reports for MAK Motel for December 2007, and January, February, March and April 2008. I have also provided a random sampling of daily reports, which shows that room rentals were distributed fairly evenly, and not limited to one wing of the motel. I misstated the number of rooms when we spoke on the phone. There are a total of 42 rooms. Room numbers 2-23 are in the wing where the gas meter reported usage more than ten times greater than expected. The gas meter for room numbers 24-43 shows normal expected readings. All daily reports are available upon request if desired.

My first involvement with this case was on March 18, 2008, after which I have observed normal, expected gas usage readings from that day forward. After reviewing all the data available to me, the only possible explanation I could arrive at is that the dials of the meter were tampered with, and that the gas was never actually delivered or used, as indicated.

Thank you for your thoughtful consideration in this matter.

CG

IMPORTANT NOTICE

This facsimile transmission is attorney communication and is privileged. It is intended only for the use of the addressee. If you receive this communication and are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that the copying or distribution of this transmission is prohibited, in which case please immediately destroy the original message and notify the sender by telephone.

Charles Gruenspan Co., L.P.A.

605 THREE COMMERCE PARK SQUARE
23230 CHAGRIN BOULEVARD
CLEVELAND, OHIO 44122
cgruenspanlp@gmail.com
FACSIMILE (216) 595-6307
TELEPHONE (216) 595-8300

FACSIMILE COVER PAGE

To: Carmen Gabriel	From: Charles Gruenspan
Fax #: 736-5313	Fax #:
Company: Dominion East Ohio	Tel #:
Subject: MAK Motel Inc. Account Number 0 5000 0534 5899	
Sent: 4/28/2008 at 4:04:42 PM	Pages: 2 (including cover)

Regarding MAK Motel, a review based on the actual readings from bills available on line shows that for about 22 of the previous 24 months MAK averaged about one (1) MCF of gas usage per month. Then for two months in 2008 the gas meter reported that gas usage had apparently jumped more than ten-fold, with no logical explanation available. A gas company check for leaks found none. The boiler that used to heat the motel rooms had been off for about two years. Electric bills indicate that the rooms were heated by the wall mounted heat pumps, as expected. The water bills indicate no jump in usage, which rules out a huge water leak as the cause of the jump in alleged gas usage. The attached chart shows that weather cannot be the cause, because there was not that much difference between the months of normal usage, and the two months with apparently abnormal usage. With no logical explanation for gas usage, the only reasonable explanation is that the gas was never used or supplied as indicated on the meter.

Under the threat of having to close his business, MAK paid \$14,000 to keep the gas on, with more than \$6,000 still owed under threat of shut-off this month. MAK disputes all but \$1,400 (10%) of the amount paid, and all but \$600 (10%) of the bill still owed.

Thank you for all courtesies in reviewing this matter.

CG

IMPORTANT NOTICE

This facsimile transmission is attorney communication and is privileged. It is intended only for the use of the addressee. If you receive this communication and are not the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that the copying or distribution of this transmission is prohibited, in which case please immediately destroy the original message and notify the sender by telephone.

MAK Motel actual gas meter readings (4/3/06-4/5/08)

Date	Actual Reading	Ave Temp	MCF	Days	MCF/day	
04/03/06	2071.3					* reading derived from 4/5/07 bill
04/03/07	2504.3		433.0	365	1.2	total annual usage from 4/5/07 bill
06/01/07	2553.1	53	48.8	59	0.8	
08/02/07	2585.0	71	31.9	62	0.5	
10/04/07	2619.0	66	34.0	63	0.5	
12/03/07	2664.8	41	45.8	60	0.8	
02/05/08	3380.2	31	715.4	64	11.2	customer notified Dominion of anomaly
02/15/08	3537.1	27	156.9	10	15.7	special meter reading by Dominion
03/18/08	3953.0	34	415.9	32	13.0	first customer meter reading
03/19/08	3953.8	34	0.8	1	0.8	
03/21/08	3956.8	34	3.0	2	1.5	
03/24/08	3960.8	34	4.0	3	1.3	
03/27/08	3962.6	34	1.8	3	0.6	
04/05/08	3970.1	34	7.5	9	0.8	