**Before**

**Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and )

Ohio Power Company for Authority to ) Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO

Establish a Standard Service Offer ) Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO

Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, )

in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. )

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and ) Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM

Ohio Power Company for Approval of ) Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

Certain Accounting Authority. )

In the Matter of the Commission Review of )

the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power Company ) Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC

and Columbus Southern Power Company. )

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO’S Memorandum Contra The Motion to Consolidate of Ohio Power Company**

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq.

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: 614-469-8000

Telecopier: 614-469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**September 17, 2012 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**Before**

**Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and )

Ohio Power Company for Authority to ) Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO

Establish a Standard Service Offer ) Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO

Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, )

in the Form of an Electric Security Plan. )

In the Matter of the Application of )

Columbus Southern Power Company and ) Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM

Ohio Power Company for Approval of ) Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

Certain Accounting Authority. )

In the Matter of the Commission Review of )

the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power Company ) Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC

and Columbus Southern Power Company. )

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO’S Memorandum Contra The Motion to Consolidate of Ohio Power Company**

**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

1. **INTRODUCTION**

On September 11, 2012 Ohio Power Company (“AEP-Ohio”) filed an untimely motion to consolidate two of its pending proceedings: Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO, *et al.* (“*ESP II Case*”) and Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC (“*Capacity Case*”).[[1]](#footnote-1) The records in both proceedings are closed and the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) has issued decisions in both proceedings. Procedurally, the two proceedings are ripe for a Commission decision addressing the merits of the applications for rehearing filed by various parties. As the law, Commission precedent, and AEP-Ohio’s own statements make clear, the timeframe to consolidate the proceedings has passed.

1. **ARGUMENT**

AEP-Ohio’s motion improperly requests that the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case* be consolidated. AEP-Ohio’s request is untimely. An order on rehearing granting the consolidation would run afoul of the law and would cause additional confusion between the two separate and distinct records. As recently as July 24, 2012, AEP-Ohio agreed that such consolidation is improper.[[2]](#footnote-2)

On July 20, 2012, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (“OCC”) and the Appalachian Peace and Justice Network (“APJN”) filed a joint motion to take administrative notice of parts of the *Capacity Case* record in the *ESP II Case*. AEP-Ohio filed a memo contra stating:

[AEP-Ohio] does not support the motion filed by OCC/APJN because it is inappropriate, raises due process concerns, and fails to recognize that the present proceeding has already been submitted to the Commission for decision.

...

OCC/APJN’s request for administrative notice at this point in the proceeding is awkward at best. The modified ESP proceeding is now submitted to the Commission for decision and the record is established. The Commission held public hearings, an evidentiary hearing, entertained two rounds of post hearing briefing and held an oral argument before all of the Commissioners. ***The time for procedural maneuvers and argumentation is now complete and the record is in the hands of the Commission for determination.***[[3]](#footnote-3)

Similarly, in AEP-Ohio’s application for rehearing in the *Capacity Case*, AEP-Ohio stated:

Although this case and Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO address interrelated issues, the Commission may not assign an issue that must be decided in this proceeding to another proceeding with an independent case schedule and rehearing and appeal processes.[[4]](#footnote-4)

While AEP-Ohio’s application for rehearing indicates that it has changed its position and now thinks it is reasonable and lawful for the Commission to consolidate the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case*, the law and the Commission’s precedent hold otherwise.

Commission proceedings are to be conducted in the same manner as civil actions unless otherwise provided by law. Section 4903.22, Revised Code provides:

[e]xcept when otherwise provided by law, all processes in actions and proceedings in a court arising under Chapters 4901., 4903., 4905., 4906., 4907., 4909., 4921., 4923., and 4927. of the Revised Code shall be served, and the practice and rules of evidence in such actions and proceedings *shall be the same, as in civil actions*. (emphasis added).

Civil Rule 42(A) governs consolidation and provides:

[w]hen actions involving a common question of law or fact are pending before a court, that court after a hearing *may order a joint hearing or trial of any or all the matters in issue in the actions*; it may order some or all of the actions consolidated; and it may make such orders concerning proceedings therein as may tend to avoid unnecessary costs or delay. (emphasis added).

First, Civil Rule 42(A) clearly contemplates that cases may be consolidated to develop a joint record when the cases involve common questions of law or fact. However, because the cases were not consolidated before the individual records were developed, it would be unlawful and unreasonable to consolidate the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case* now. The Commission has also held that it is inappropriate to consolidate cases after the close of the evidentiary record.[[5]](#footnote-5) In fact, in the *ESP II Case* the Commission denied OCC/APJN’s motion to take administrative notice of parts of the record from the *Capacity Case*, finding “the timing of OCC/APJN’s request [was] troublesome and problematic.”[[6]](#footnote-6)

Second, consolidating cases after the evidentiary records in the proceedings have closed would violate parties’ due process rights. The parties in the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case* are not the same. The witnesses in the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case* are not the same. The issues in the *ESP II Case* and the *Capacity Case* are not the same. The Capacity Order[[7]](#footnote-7) states (wrongly) that the Commission’s general supervisory authority and Chapter 4909, Revised Code, are controlling,[[8]](#footnote-8) while the ESP II Order must be valid, if it can be valid, based on Sections 4928.141 and 4928.143, Revised Code. Using the record in one proceeding to support decisions in another proceeding prevents parties from putting on evidence in the form of testimony and exhibits, cross-examining other witnesses on the issues, and addressing the issues on brief; these requirements are essential for due process.[[9]](#footnote-9)

Third, Section 4903.09, Revised Code, requires the Commission to base its orders upon the record in front of it.[[10]](#footnote-10)

[I]n order to meet the requirements of R.C. 4903.09, \* \* \* the PUCO's order must show, in sufficient detail, the facts in the record upon which the order is based, and the reasoning followed by the PUCO in reaching its conclusion. ... [A] legion of cases establish that the commission abuses its discretion if it renders an opinion on an issue without record support.[[11]](#footnote-11)

Were the Commission to consolidate the cases at this point, its entries on rehearing modifying the ESP II Order or the Capacity Order would not be based on their individual records.

Consolidating the two proceedings at this point would violate Civil Rule 42(A) and will not aid the Commission in reaching its decisions on rehearing. Consolidation would also violate parties’ due process rights. Further, each proceeding must be decided upon the separate and distinct records. Therefore, AEP-Ohio’s motion to consolidate the *ESP II Case* with the *Capacity Case* is unlawful and unreasonable and must be denied.

1. **CONCLUSION**

For the reasons discussed above, the Commission must deny AEP-Ohio’s motion to consolidate the *ESP II Case* with the *Capacity Case*.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Matthew R. Pritchard

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Joseph E. Oliker

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

sam@mwnmch.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

joliker@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

**Attorneys for** **Industrial Energy Users-Ohio**

**Certificate of Service**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Industrial Energy Users-Ohio’s Memorandum Contra the Motion to Consolidate of Ohio Power Company* was served upon the following parties of record this 17th day of September 2012, *via* electronic transmission, hand-delivery or first class U.S. mail, postage prepaid.

/s/ Matthew R. Pritchard

Matthew R. Pritchard

Matthew J. Satterwhite

Steven T. Nourse

Anne M. Vogel

Yazen Alami

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

mjsatterwhite@aep.com

stnourse@aep.com

amvogel@aep.com

yalami@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway

Christen M. Moore

Porter Wright Morris & Arthur

41 S. High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

dconway@porterwright.com

cmoore@porterwright.com

Derek Shaffer

Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan, LLP

1299 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 825

Washington, DC 20004

derekshaffer@quinnemanuel.com

**On Behalf of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company**

Robert A. McMahon

Eberly McMahon LLC

2321 Kemper Lane, Suite 100

Cincinnati, OH 45206

Rocco D’Ascenzo

Elisabeth Watts

Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.

139 East Fourth Street - 1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Rocco.d’ascenzo@duke-energy.com

**On Behalf of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.**

Amy B. Spiller

Jeanne W. Kingery

Dorothy Kim Corbett

139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main

P.O. Box 961

Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960

Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

Dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com

Philip B. Sineneng

Thompson Hine LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Philip.Sineneng@thompsonhine.com

**On Behalf of Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC and Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.**

David F. Boehm

Michael L. Kurtz

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Energy Group**

Gregory J. Poulos

EnerNOC, Inc.

101 Federal Street, Suite 1100

Boston, MA 02110

gpoulos@enernoc.com

**On Behalf of EnerNOC, Inc.**

Kyle L. Kern

Terry L. Etter

Melissa R. Yost

Maureen R. Grady

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 W. Broad Street, 18th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

kern@occ.state.oh.us

etter@occ.state.oh.us

grady@occ.state.oh.us

yost@occ.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio**

**Consumers’ Counsel**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler, LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

tobrien@bricker.com

**Oh Behalf of Ohio Hospital Association**

Mark S. Yurick

Zachary D. Kravitz

Taft Stettinius & Hollister

65 East State Street, Suite 1000

Columbus, OH 43215

myurick@taftlaw.com

zkravitz@taftlaw.com

**On Behalf of The Kroger Co.**

Terrence O’Donnell

Christopher Montgomery

Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

todonnell@bricker.com

cmontgomery@bricker.com

mwarnock@bricker.com

**On Behalf of Paulding Wind Farm II LLC**

Mark A. Hayden

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F Lang

Laura C. McBride

N. Trevor Alexander

Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP

1400 KeyBank Center

800 Superior Ave.

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

lmcbride@calfee.com

talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik

Jones Day

North Point

901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, OH 44114

dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt

Jones Day

P.O. Box 165017

Columbus, OH 43216-5017

aehaedt@jonesday.com

John N. Estes III

Paul F. Wight

Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP

1440 New York Ave., N.W.

Washington, DC 20005

jestes@skadden.com

paul.wight@skadden.com

**On Behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.**

Michael R. Smalz

Joseph V. Maskovyak

Ohio Poverty Law Center

555 Buttles Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215

msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org

jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

**On Behalf of the Appalachian Peace and Justice Network**

Lisa G. McAlister

J. Thomas Siwo

Thomas O’Brien

BRICKER & ECKLER LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

lmcalister@bricker.com

tsiwo@bricker.com

tobrien@bricker.com

**On Behalf of OMA Energy Group**

Jay E. Jadwin

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

jejadwin@aep.com

**On Behalf of AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43215-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

**On Behalf of PJM Power Providers Group and the Retail Energy Supply Association**

Glen Thomas

1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400

King of Prussia, PA 19406

gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle

4218 Jacob Meadows

Okemos, MI 48864

laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

**On Behalf of PJM Power Providers Group**

M. Howard Petricoff

Michael Settineri

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43215-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

mjsettineri@vorys.com

William L. Massey

Covington & Burling, LLP

1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20004

wmassey@cov.com

Joel Malina

Executive Director

COMPLETE Coalition

1317 F Street, NW

Suite 600

Washington, DC 20004

malina@wexlerwalker.com

**On Behalf of the COMPLETE Coalition**

Henry W. Eckhart

1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106

Columbus, OH 43212

henryeckhart@aol.com

Christopher J. Allwein

Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC

1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212

Columbus, OH 43212

callwein@williamsandmoser.com

**On Behalf of the Natural Resources Defense Council and the Sierra Club**

M. Howard Petricoff

Michael J. Settineri

Stephen M. Howard

Lija Kaleps-Clark

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

mjsettineri@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

lkalepsclark@vorys.com

**On Behalf of Constellation NewEnergy, Inc., Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc. , Direct Energy Services, LLC**

Barth E. Royer

Bell & Royer Co., LPA

33 South Grant Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215-3927

BarthRoyer@aol.com

Gary A Jeffries

Assistant General Counsel

Dominion Resources Services, Inc.

501 Martindale Street, Suite 400

Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817

Gary.A.Jeffries@aol.com

**On Behalf of Dominion Retail, Inc.**

David I. Fein

Vice President, Energy Policy – Midwest

Constellation Energy Group, Inc.

Cynthia Fonner Brady

Senior Counsel

Constellation Energy Resources LLC

550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

david.fein@constellation.com

cynthia.brady@constellation.com

**On Behalf of Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Constellation Energy Commodities Group, Inc.**

David C. Rinebolt

Colleen L. Mooney

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

231 West Lima Street

P.O. Box 1793

Findlay, OH 45839-1793

drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

**Counsel for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy**

Jeanine Amid Hummer

Thomas K. Lindsey

*City of Upper Arlington*

C. Todd Jones,

Christopher L. Miller,

Gregory H. Dunn

Asim Z. Haque

Ice Miller LLC

250 West Street

Columbus, OH 43215

christopher.miller@icemiller.com

gregory.dunn@icemiller.com

asim.haque@icemiller.com

jhummer@uaoh.net

tlindsey@uaoh.net

**On Behalf of the City of Grove City, Ohio and the Association of Independent Colleges and Universities of Ohio, The City of Upper Arlington, The City of Hillsboro, Ohio**

Sandy I-ru Grace

Assistant General Counsel

Exelon Business Services Company

101 Constitution Ave., NW

Suite 400 East

Washington, DC 20001

sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

M. Howard Petricoff

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street/P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

David M. Stahl

Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP

224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100

Chicago, IL 60604

dstahl@eimerstahl.com

**On Behalf of Exelon Generation Company, LLC**

Kenneth P. Kreider

David A. Meyer

Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL

One East Fourth Street

Suite 1400

Cincinnati, OH 45202

kpkreider@kmklaw.com

dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith

Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC

Hitt Business Center

3803 Rectortown Road

Marshall, VA 20115

holly@raysmithlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss

Manager, State Rate Proceedings

Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.

Bentonville, AR 72716-0550

Stephen.Chriss@wal-mart.com

**On Behalf of Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.**

Barth E. Royer (Counsel of Record)

Bell & Royer Co., LPA

33 South Grant Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215-3927

BarthRoyer@aol.com

Tara C. Santarelli

Environmental Law & Policy Center

1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212

tsantarelli@elpc.org

**On Behalf of the Environmental Law &**

**Policy Center**

Nolan Moser

Trent A. Dougherty

Camille Yancy

Cathryn Loucas

Ohio Environmental Council

1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201

Columbus, OH 43212-3449

nolan@theoec.org

trent@theoec.org

camille@theoec.org

cathy@theoec.org.

**On Behalf of the Ohio Environmental Council**

Robert Korandovich

KOREnergy

P.O. Box 148

Sunbury, OH 43074

korenergy@insight.rr.com

**On Behalf of KOREnergy**

Douglas G. Bonner

Emma F. Hand

Keith C. Nusbaum

Clinton A. Vince

Daniel D. Barnowski

James Rubin

Thomas Millar

SNR Denton US LLP

1301 K Street NW

Suite 600, East Tower

Washington, DC 20005

doug.bonner@snrdenton.com

emma.hand@snrdenton.com

keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com

clinton.vince@snrdenton.com

daniel.barnowski@snrdenton.con

james.rubin@snrdenton.com

thomas.millar@snrdenton.com

Arthur Beeman

SNR Denton US LLP

525 Market Street, 26th Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105-2708

arthur.beeman@snrdenton.com

**On Behalf of Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation**

Jay L. Kooper

Katherine Guerry

Hess Corporation

One Hess Plaza

Woodbridge, NJ 07095

jkooper@hess.com

kguerry@hess.com

**On Behalf of Hess Corporation**

Allen Freifeld

Samuel A. Wolfe

Viridity Energy, Inc.

100 West Elm Street, Suite 410

Conshohocken, PA 19428

afreifeld@viridityenergy.com

swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Jacqueline Lake Roberts,

Counsel of Record

101 Federal Street, Suite 1100

Boston, MA 02110

jroberts@enernoc.com

**On Behalf of CPower, Inc., Viridity Energy, Inc., EnergyConnect Inc., Comverge Inc., Enerwise Global Technologies, Inc., and Energy Curtailment Specialists, Inc.**

Benita Kahn

Lija Kaleps-Clark

Vorys Sater, Seymour and Pease LLC

52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

bakahn@vorys.com

lkalepsclark@vorys.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association**

Mark A. Whitt

Andrew J. Campbell

Whitt Sturtevant LLP

PNC Plaza, Suite 2020

155 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215

whit@whitt-sturtevant.com

Campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com

Matthew White

Vincent Parisi

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

6100 Emerald Parkway

Dublin, OH 43016

mswhite@igsenergy.com

vparisi@igsenergy.com

**On Behalf of Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.**

Dane Stinson

Bailey Cavalieri LLC

10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100

Columbus, OH 43215

**On Behalf of The Ohio Association of School Business Officials, The Ohio School Boards Association, The Ohio Schools Council and The Buckeye Association of School Administrators**

Chad A. Endsley

Chief Legal Counsel

Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

280 North High Street, P.O. Box 182383

Columbus, OH 43218-2383

cendsley@ofbf.org.

**On Behalf of the Ohio Farm Bureau Federation**

Brian P. Barger

Brady, Coyle & Schmidt, LTD

4052 Holland-Sylvania Rd.

Toledo, OH 43623

bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Construction Materials Coalition**

Diem N. Kaelber

Robert J Walter

BUCKLEY KING LPA

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, OH 43215

kaelber@buckleyking.com

walter@buckleyking.com

**On Behalf of Ohio Restaurant Association**

Judi L. Sobecki

Randall V. Griffin

The Dayton Power and Light Company

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Judi.sobecki@dplinc.com

Randall.griffin@dplinc.com

**On Behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company**

Sara Reich Bruce

Ohio Automobile Dealers Association

655 Metro Place South, Suite 270

Dublin, OH 43017

sbruce@oada.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Automobile Dealers Association**

Joseph M. Clark

Direct Energy Services LLC

And Direct Energy Business LLC

6641 North High Street, Suite 200

Worthington, OH 43085

joseph.clark@directenergy.com

**On Behalf of Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC**

Todd M. Williams

Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC

Two Maritime Plaza-Third Floor

Toledo, OH 43604

toddm@wamenergylaw.com

**On Behalf of the Ohio Business Council for a Clean Economy**

Matthew R. Cox

Matthew Cox Law, Ltd.

4145 St. Theresa Blvd.

Avon, OH 44011

matt@matthewcoxlaw.com

**On Behalf of the Council of Smaller Enterprises (COSE)**

Stephanie M. Chmiel

Michael L. Dillard

THOMPSON HINE LLP

41 S. High Street, Suite 1700

Columbus, OH 43215

Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com

Michael.Dillard@ThompsonHine.com

**On Behalf of Border Energy Electric Services, Inc.**

Randy J. Hart

Rob Remington

David J. Michalski

200 Public Square, Suite 2800

Cleveland, OH 44114-2316

rhart@hahnlaw.com

rrremington@hahnlaw.com

djmichalski@hahnlaw.com

**On Behalf of Summit Ethanol, LLC and**

**Fostoria Ethanol, LLC**

Robert Burke

Braith Kelly

Competitive Power Ventures, Inc.

8403 Colesville Road, Ste. 915

Silver Spring, MD 20910

rburke@cpv.com

bkelly@cpv.com

Larry F. Eisenstat

(Counsel of Record)

Richard Lehfeldt

Robert L. Kinder, Jr.

Dickstein Shapiro LLP

1825 Eye St. NW

Washington, DC 20006

eisenstatl@dicksteinshapiro.com

lehfeldtr@dicksteinshapiro.com

kinderr@dicksteinshapiro.com

Robert L. Kinder, Jr.

Dickstein Shapiro LLP

1825 Eye St. NW

Washington, DC 20006

kinder@DicksteinShapiro.com

**On Behalf of CPV Power Development, Inc.**

Jack D’Aurora

The Behal Law Group LLC

501 South High Street

Columbus, OH 43215

jdaurora@behallaw.com

**On Behalf of the University of Toledo**

Roger P. Sugarman

Kegler, Brown, Hill &Ritter

65 East State Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215

rsugarman@keglerbrown.com

**On Behalf of NFIB/Ohio**

William Wright

Werner Margard

Thomas Lindgren

John H. Jones

Steven Beeler

Assistant Attorneys’ General

Public Utilities Section

180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

john.jones@puc.state.oh.us

werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us

thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

william.wright@puc.state.oh.us

steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us

**On Behalf of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Greta See

Jon Tauber

Sarah Parrot

Attorney Examiner

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Greta.See@puc.state.oh.us

Sarah.Parrot@puc.state.oh.us

jonathan.tauber@puc.state.oh.us

**Attorney Examiners**

1. AEP-Ohio made the same request in its application for rehearing in the *ESP II Case*. *ESP II Case*,AEP-Ohio Application for Rehearing at 47-49 (Sept. 7, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. *ESP II Case*, AEP-Ohio’s Memorandum Contra the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel and Appalachian Peace and Justice Network’s Motion to Take Administrative Notice at 1-2 (July 24, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Id.* (emphasis added). [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. *Capacity Case*, AEP‑Ohio Application for Rehearing at 6 (July 20, 2012). [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. *See In the Matter of the Application of The Ohio Bell Tele- phone Company to Revise its Exchange and Network Services Tariff, PUCO No. 1, to Establish Automatic Callback which is a New Advanced Custom Calling Service Feature*, Case No. 93-343-TP-ATA, Entry at 2-3 (April 29, 2012) [“Upon review of Rule 42(A) and contrary to ODVN's definitive statement that such a motion would be granted in the court system, it is evident that, while consolidation of issues is permissible, it is not required as stated by ODVN. Final orders have been issued in the three cases which ODVN requested be consolidated with this case.  In fact, two of the cases, 90-467 and 90-471, have already been appealed to the Ohio Supreme Court.”]. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. *ESP II* Case, Opinion and Order at 12 (Aug. 8, 2012) (hereinafter, “ESP II Order”). [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. As used herein, “Capacity Order” refers to the July 2, 2012 Opinion and Order issued by the Commission in the *Capacity Case*. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. *Id.* at 12-13. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. *Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc. v. Pub. Util. Comm.,* 113 Ohio St.3d 180, 863 N.E.2d 599; 2006-Ohio-1386 at ¶ 53; *see also Public Utilities Commission of District of Columbia v. Pollak*, 343 U.S. 451, 465 (1952); *Ohio Bell Tel. Co. v. Public Utilities Commission of Ohio*, 301 U.S. 292, 300 (1937). [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. *See also In re Application of Columbus S. Power Co.*, 128 Ohio St.3d 512, 2011-Ohio-1788 at ¶¶ 70-71; *Ohio Bell Tel. Co. v. Public Utilities Commission of Ohio*, 301 U.S. 292, 300 (1937); *Tongren v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 85 Ohio St.3d 87, 92-93 (1999). [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. *Indus. Energy Users-Ohio v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 117 Ohio St.3d 486, 2008-Ohio-990 at ¶ 30 (internal quotations omitted). [↑](#footnote-ref-11)