**BEFORE**

**THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Commission’s Investigation into PALMco Power OH, LLC dba Indra Energy and PALMco Energy OH, LLC dba Indra Energy’s Compliance with the Ohio Administrative Code and Potential Remedial Actions for Non-Compliance. | )  )  )  )  )  )  )  ) | Case No. 19-0957-GE-COI |

**AMENDED NOTICE TO TAKE DEPOSITIONS**

**AND REQUESTS FOR PRODUCTION OF DOCUMENTS**

**BY**

**THE Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO”), acting on over 300 customer complaints in less than a year, has investigated the marketing practices of PALMco Power OH, LLC (“PALMco”) and found “a pattern of unfair, misleading, deceptive, and unconscionable activities” with issues that “appear to be systemic and demonstrate that the company’s management decisions inappropriately orchestrate a marketing program reliant upon misleading and deceiving customers, rather than in an manner that is fair, honest, and in compliance with Ohio laws and rules.” [[1]](#footnote-2) PALMco’s reported misconduct against Ohioans shocks the conscience.

To protect customers, in accordance with Ohio Adm. Code Section 4901-1-21(B), please take notice that the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (“OCC”) will take the deposition upon oral examination of the following individuals:

1. Person(s) employed by PALMco Power OH, LLC dba Indra Energy and PALMco Energy OH, LLC dba Indra Energy (“PALMco”) with knowledge and expertise regarding:
   1. PALMco’s current financial condition.
   2. The availability of funds to PALMco that could be used by PALMco to provide restitution to PALMco customers.
   3. The availability of funds to PALMco that could be used by PALMco to pay forfeitures to the State of Ohio.
   4. PALMco’s keeping of corporate records, the manner in which PALMco’s funds are kept, and/or the use of PALMco’s corporate property.
   5. Service contracts, agreements, work orders, and/or other documents governing the transfer of funds, goods, and/or services between PALMco and its parent and subsidiary companies.
   6. Collateral obligations and/or agreements PALMco has with respect to each Ohio gas and electric distribution utility pertaining to PALMco’s supply of electric and gas competitive retail services in Ohio.
   7. The Joint Stipulation and Recommendation filed at the PUCO on July 31, 2019 and the negotiations leading up to the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation.
2. All person(s) who will be called by PALMco to present testimony, including direct, rebuttal, surrebuttal, and any other form of testimony filed, or to be filed, in these proceedings.
3. All person(s) responsible for answering OCC’s interrogatories, responding to requests for production of documents (including responses that state that no documents are responsive to a request to produce), and/or responding to requests for admissions regarding disconnection served in these proceedings upon PALMco.
4. All person(s) responsible for preparing Exhibits C-3 and C-5 to PALMco’s Electric Renewal Certificate Application, filed before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 10-139-EL-CRS on January 18, 2018.
5. All person(s) responsible for preparing Exhibits C-3 and C-5 to PALMco’s Natural Gas Renewal Certificate Application, filed before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 10-138-GA-CRS on January 16, 2018.

The deposition will be conducted at OCC’s offices, 65 East State Street, 7th Floor, Columbus, Ohio, 43215, starting on August 13, 2019 at 10:00 a.m., or at another time and date agreed upon by OCC and PALMco, and will continue from day to day, except for holidays and weekends, until completed. The deponent(s) will appear at the designated time and date with all requested documents (identified below) and will remain present until deposed. Deponents will be deposed one after another.

The deposition will be taken of the aforementioned deponent(s) on relevant topics within the scope of this proceeding, including but not limited to, each deponent’s knowledge and expertise with the subject matter of these proceedings. The deposition will be taken upon oral examination (as upon cross-examination) before an officer authorized by law to take depositions.

Pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code Rules 4901-1-21(E) and 4901-1-20, OCC requests that each deponent produce, at least one day prior to the taking of his/her deposition, the following documents:

1. A copy of each deponent’s testimony filed in this case;
2. A copy of all workpapers each deponent used in developing his/her testimony;

1. A copy of all documents each deponent used in answering OCC discovery and/or PUCO Staff data requests;
2. A copy of all documents upon which each deponent bases his/her knowledge of PALMco’s current financial condition, the availability of funds that could be used by PALMco to provide restitution to PALMco’s customers and forfeitures to the State of Ohio, the use of PALMco’s corporate property and/or funds, and/or the manner in which funds are kept;
3. Exhibits C-3 and C-5 to PALMco’s Electric Renewal Certificate Application, filed before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 10-139-EL-CRS on January 18, 2018;
4. Exhibits C-3 and C-5 to PALMco’s Natural Gas Renewal Certificate Application, filed before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 10-138-GA-CRS on January 16, 2018;
5. A copy of all collateral agreements PALMco has entered into with Ohio electric and gas distribution utilities pertaining to its marketing of electric and gas service in Ohio;
6. Service contracts, agreements, work orders, and/or other documents governing the transfer of funds, goods, and/or services between PALMco and its parent and subsidiary companies; and
7. All documents and workpapers that support or are related to the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation filed at the PUCO on July 31, 2019.

Respectfully submitted,

Bruce Weston (0016973)

Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

*/s/ Terry L. Etter*

Terry L. Etter (0067445), Counsel of Record

Amy Botschner O’Brien (0074423)

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

# Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

# 65 East State Street, 7th Floor

# Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone [Etter]: (614) 466-7964

Telephone [Botschner O’Brien]: (614) 466-9575

[Terry.etter@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:Terry.etter@occ.ohio.gov)

[amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov](mailto:amy.botschner.obrien@occ.ohio.gov)

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

Kimberly W. Bojko

Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP

280 North High Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, Ohio 43215

Telephone: (614) 365-4100

[bojko@carpenterlipps.com](mailto:bojko@carpenterlipps.com)

*Outside Counsel for the*

*Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Notice to Take Deposition and Requests for Production of Documents was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission this 2nd day of August 2019.

*/s/ Terry L. Etter*

Terry L. Etter

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

**SERVICE LIST**

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| [Jodi.bair@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:Jodi.bair@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  [whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com)  [Glover@whitt-sturtevant.com](mailto:Glover@whitt-sturtevant.com) | Jennifer Coleman  PALMco Energy OH, LLC,  dba Indra Energy  8751 18th Avenue  Brooklyn, NY 11214  [regulatory@indraenergy.com](mailto:regulatory@indraenergy.com) |
| Attorney Examiners:  [Stacie.Cathcart@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:Stacie.Cathcart@puco.ohio.gov)  [Anna.Sanyal@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:Anna.Sanyal@puco.ohio.gov) |  |

1. PUCO Staff Report at 2 (May 10, 2019). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)