Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio )

Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric )

Illuminating Company and The Toledo )

Edison Company for Authority to Provide ) Case No. 12-1230-EL-SSO

for a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to )

R.C. § 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric )

Security Plan. )

**REPLY BRIEF OF**

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

June 29, 2012 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio )

Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric )

Illuminating Company and The Toledo )

Edison Company for Authority to Provide ) Case No. 12-1230-EL-SSO

for a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to )

R.C. § 4928.143 in the Form of an Electric )

Security Plan. )

# REPLY BRIEF OF

**INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERS-OHIO**

On April 13, 2012, Ohio Edison Company (“OE”), The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company (“CEI”), and The Toledo Edison Company (“TE”) (collectively, “FirstEnergy”) filed an Application to establish a standard service offer (“SSO”) in the form of an electric security plan (“ESP”). Concurrently with the filing of the Application, FirstEnergy and several signatory parties filed a Stipulation and Recommendation (“Stipulation”)[[1]](#footnote-1) recommending the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) approve the proposed ESP (the “ESP III”). The ESP III would in large measure contain minimal change to FirstEnergy’s current ESP (the “ESP II”) and was intended to, in part, facilitate the bidding of demand response resources into PJM Interconnection, LLC’s (“PJM”) base residual auction (“BRA”) for the 2015/2016 delivery period if the Commission approved ESP III by no later than May 2, 2012.[[2]](#footnote-2) If the Commission was unable to approve ESP III by May 2, 2012 to facilitate demand resource participation in the PJM 2015/2016 BRA, the Commission was alternatively requested to approve ESP III by no later than June 20, 2012 in order to allow sufficient time to modify the bidding schedule for the October 2012 SSO auction.[[3]](#footnote-3)

The Industrial Energy Users-Ohio (“IEU-Ohio”) files this Reply Brief to respond to an argument raised in the Post-Hearing Brief submitted by EnerNoc, Inc. (“EnerNoc”). The failure of IEU-Ohio to address arguments raised by other parties in their initial briefs should not be construed as acceptance of those arguments. As noted by IEU-Ohio in its Post-Hearing Brief, the use of a competitive bidding process (“CBP”) to establish FirstEnergy’s SSO generation rates will occur as a matter of law until and unless a new ESP is put in place as a successor to ESP II.[[4]](#footnote-4) Thus, the Stipulation provides the Commission with the opportunity to take some of the guesswork out of future SSO customer rates, and warrants approval.

Rather than using the Stipulation as a tool to provide predictable customer outcomes, EnerNoc, a non-opposing signatory party to the Stipulation, who now nevertheless recommends approval of the Stipulation,[[5]](#footnote-5) urges the Commission to interpret the Stipulation in a manner contrary to its intent and in a way that will increase rates for SSO customers. EnerNoc argues that the Stipulation requires FirstEnergy (and the Commission) to foreclose customers from continuing to receive service pursuant to the Economic Load Response tariff (“Rider ELR”) if customers did not execute contract addendums by May 3, 2012.[[6]](#footnote-6)

 As discussed above, one of the goals of the Stipulation was “enabling the Companies to bid demand response resources and PJM-qualifying energy efficiency resources into the PJM 2015-2016 Base Residual Auction.”[[7]](#footnote-7) But in order to translate this goal into reality, the Commission was requested to approve the Stipulation by
May 2, 2012 because bidding into the 2015/2016 BRA began on May 7, 2012.[[8]](#footnote-8) When this did not occur, the second actionable step (the customer’s execution of a contract addendum by May 3, 2012) necessary for FirstEnergy to actually offer demand response bids into the 2015/2016 BRA became moot.

Notwithstanding whether demand response resources were bid into the 2015/2016 BRA, the need for customers to commit to service pursuant to Rider ELR has not diminished. As Ohio electric distribution utilities, OE, CEI and TE have statutory obligations pursuant to Amended Substitute Senate Bill 221 to achieve peak demand reductions.[[9]](#footnote-9) FirstEnergy intends to rely upon customers electing service pursuant to Rider ELR as one option to meet its statutorily required peak demand reduction.[[10]](#footnote-10) Therefore, as FirstEnergy witness William Ridmann testified, FirstEnergy will inform the relevant customers of the new required date to execute addendums to elect to continue service pursuant to Rider ELR following the issuance of an Order in this proceeding.[[11]](#footnote-11) EnerNOC claims that if the May 3, 2012 date to elect service under Rider ELR is not required, this will result in a negative impact on [capacity] prices in the ATSI zone.[[12]](#footnote-12) EnerNOC’s claims are flawed and unsupported by any evidence. EnerNOC claims that extending the availability of Rider ELR for the term of ESP III will preclude interruptible load from offering into the PJM BRA for 2016/2017 and 2017/2018 delivery years.[[13]](#footnote-13) That assertion is simply incorrect. Because the proposed term of ESP III terminates on May 31, 2016, there is no obligation for customers to continue service under Rider ELR after May 31, 2016 and customers with the capability to curtail usage as a PJM capacity resource are freely able to participate in PJM’s BRA for 2016/2017 and 2017/2018 delivery years. In fact, the risk and uncertainty associated with whether customers served under Rider ELR will be bid into future BRAs can be remedied by extending the term of Rider ELR, rather than foreclosing customers to elect service under Rider ELR.[[14]](#footnote-14)

For these reasons and for the reasons set forth in its Post-Hearing Brief,
IEU-Ohio urges the Commission to approve the Stipulation.

 Respectfully submitted,

 /s/ Samuel C. Randazzo

Samuel C. Randazzo (Counsel of Record)

Frank P. Darr

Matthew R. Pritchard

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4228

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

sam@mwncmh.com

fdarr@mwncmh.com

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

 Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

**Certificate of Service**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *Reply Brief of Industrial Energy Users-Ohio,* was served upon the following parties of record this 29th day of June 2012, *via* hand-delivery, electronic transmission, or first class mail, U.S. postage prepaid.

 /s/ Samuel C. Randazzo

 Samuel C. Randazzo

James W. Burk, Counsel of Record

Arthur E. Korkosz

FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

burkj@firstenergycorp.com

korkosza@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang

Laura C. McBride

CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP

1405 East Sixth Street

Cleveland, OH 44114

jlang@calfee.com

lmcbride@calfee.com

David A. Kutik

JONES DAY

901 Lakeside Avenue

Cleveland, OH 44114

dakutik@jonesday.com

**Counsel for Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company**

Colleen L. Mooney

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

231 West Lima Street

PO Box 1793

Findlay, OH 45839-1793

cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

**Counsel for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy**

Joseph M. Clark, Counsel of Record

Direct Energy

6641 North High Street, Suite 200

Worthington, OH 43085

jmclark@vectren.com

Asim Z. Haque

Christopher L. Miller

Gregory H. Dunn

Alan G. Starkoff

Ice Miller LLP

250 West Street

Columbus, OH 43215

christopher.miller@icemiller.com

asim.haque@icemiller.com

Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com

**Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC**

Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record

Terry L. Etter

Melissa R. Yost

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-3485

sauer@occ.state.oh.us

etter@occ.state.oh.us

yost@occ.state.oh.us

**Counsel for the Office of the Ohio**

**Consumers' Counsel**

Vincent Parisi

Matthew White

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

6100 Emerald Parkway

Dublin, OH 43016

vparisi@igsenergy.com

mswhite@igsenergy.com

Barth E. Royer

Bell & Royer Co., LPA

33 South Grant Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215-3927

BarthRoyer@aol.com

**Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.**

M. Howard Petricoff

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

PO Box 1008

Columbus OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

Sandy I-ru Grace

Assistant General Counsel

Exelon Business Services Company

101 Constitution Avenue N.W.

Suite 400 East

Washington, DC 20001

sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Stephen Bennett

Retail Policy Manager

Exelon Generation Company, LLC

300 Exelon Way

Kennett Square, PA 19348

Stephen.bennett@exeloncorp.com

David I. Fein

Vice President, State Government Affairs-East

Exelon Corporation

550 West Washington Boulevard, Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

David.fein@constellation.com

Cynthia Brady

Senior Counsel

Constellation Energy Resources, LLC

550 West Washington Boulevard, Suite 300

Chicago, IL 60661

Cynthia.brady@constellation.com

David M. Stahl (for Exelon)

Eimer Stahl LLP

224 S. Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100

Chicago, IL 60604

dstahl@eimerstahl.com

**Counsel for Exelon Generation Company, LLC and Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.**

Christopher J. Allwein, Counsel of Record

Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC

1373 Grandview Avenue, Suite 212

Columbus, OH 43212

callwein@wamenergylaw.com

Robb W. Kapla

Sierra Club

Environmental Law Program

85 Second Street, Second Floor

San Francisco, CA 94105-3459

Robb.kapla@sierraclub.org

**Counsel for Natural Resources Defense Council and the Sierra Club**

Leslie A. Kovacik

City of Toledo

420 Madison Avenue, Suite 100

Toledo, OH 43604-1219

leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov

Thomas R. Hays

John Borrell

Lucas County Prosecutor’s Office

700 Adams Street, Suite 251

Toledo, OH 43604

Trhayslaw@gmail.com

**Counsel for the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition**

Glenn S. Krassen

Bricker & Eckler LLP

1375 East Ninth Street, Suite 1500

Cleveland, OH 44114

gkrassen@bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215

mwarnock@bricker.com

**Counsel for Northeast Ohio Public Energy Council**

Judi L. Sobecki

Randall V. Griffin

The Dayton Power and Light Company

1065 Woodman Drive

Dayton, OH 45432

Judi.sobecki@DPLINC.com

Randall.griffin@DPLINC.com

**Counsel for The Dayton Power and Light Company**

David F. Boehm

Michael L. Kurtz

Jody M. Kyler

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry

36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510

Cincinnati, OH 45202

dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com

mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com

jklyer@BKLlawfirm.com

**Counsel for Ohio Energy Group**

Lisa G. McAlister, Counsel of Record

J. Thomas Siwo

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

lmcalister@bricker.com

tsiwo@bricker.com

**Counsel for the OMA Energy Group**

Michael D. Dortch

Kravitz Brown & Dorth, LLC

65 East State Street, Suite 200

Columbus, OH 43215

mdortch@kravitzllc.com

**Counsel for AEP Retail Energy Partners, LLC**

Trent Dougherty, Counsel of Record

Cathryn N. Loucas

The Ohio Environmental Council

1207 Grandview venue, Sutie 201

Columbus, OH 43212-3449

Trent@theoec.org

Cathy@theoec.org

**Counsel for the Ohio Environmental Council**

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

Amy B. Spiller

Deputy General Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services LLC

139 East Fourth Street, 1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

**Counsel for Duke Energy Commercial Asset Management, Inc.**

Amy B. Spiller, Counsel of Record

Deputy General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

Duke Energy Business Services LLC

139 East Fourth Street

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Jeanne.Kingery@duke-energy.com

**Counsel for Duke Energy Retail Sales, LLC**

Matthew J. Satterwhite

Steven T. Nourse

Marilyn McConnell

American Electric Power Service Corporation

1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

mjsatterwhite@aep.com

stnourse@aep.com

mmconnell@aep.com

**Counsel for Ohio Power Company**

M. Howard Petricoff

Michael J. Settineri

Lija Kaleps-Clark

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

PO Box 1008

Columbus OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

mjsettineri@vorys.com

lkalepsclark@vorys.com

**Counsel for Retail Energy Supply Association**

Gregory J. Poulos

EnerNOC, Inc.

471 E. Broad Street, Suite 1520

Columbus, OH 43215

gpoulos@enernoc.com

**Counsel for EnerNOC, Inc.**

Theodore S. Robinson

Citizen Power, Inc.

2121 Murray Avenue

Pittsburgh, PA 15217

robinson@citizenpower.com

**Counsel for Citizen Power, Inc.**

Craig I. Smith

15700 Van Aken Blvd, Suite #26

Cleveland, OH 44120

vttpmlc@aol.com

**Counsel for Materials Science Corporation**

Mark S. Yurick

Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP

65 E. State Street, Suite 1000

Columbus, OH 43215-4213

myurick@taftlaw.com

**Counsel for The Kroger Co.**

Douglas M. Mancino

McDermott Will & Emery LLP

2049 Century Park East, Suite 3800

Los Angeles, CA 90067-3218

dmancino@mwe.com

Gregory K. Lawrence

McDermott Will & Emery LLP

28 State Street

Boston, MA 02109

glawrence@mwe.com

**Counsel for Morgan Stanley Capital Group Inc.**

Glenn S. Krassen

Bricker & Eckler LLP

1001 Lakeside Avenue East, Suite 1350

Cleveland, OH 44114-1142

gkrassen@bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215

mwarnock@bricker.com

**Counsel for Ohio Schools Council**

Morgan E. Parke, Counsel of Record

Michael R. Beiting

FirstEnergy Service Company

76 South Main Street

Akron, OH 44308

mparke@firstenergycorp.com

beitingm@firstenergycorp.com

**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. (“FES”)**

C. Todd Jones

Gregory H. Dunn

Christopher L. Miller

Asim Z. Haque

Ice Miller LLP

250 West Street

Columbus, OH 43215

Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com

christopher.miller@icemiller.com

asim.haque@icemiller.com

**Counsel for the Association of Independent Colleges and Universities of Ohio and the City of Grove City, Ohio**

Dane Stinson

Bailey Cavalieri LLC

One Columbus

10 West Broad Street, Suite 2100

Columbus, OH 43215

dane.stinson@baileycavalieri.com

**Counsel for GEXA Energy-Ohio, LLC**

M. Howard Petricoff

Stephen M. Howard

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 East Gay Street

PO Box 1008

Columbus OH 43216-1008

mhpetricoff@vorys.com

smhoward@vorys.com

Glen Thomas

1060 First Avenue, Suite 400

King of Prussia, PA 19406

gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle

4218 Jacob Meadows

Okemos, MI 48864

laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

**Counsel for PJM Power Providers Group (“P3”)**

Allen Freifeld

Viridity Energy, Inc.

100 West Elm Street, Suite 410

Conshohocken, PA 19428

afreifeld@viridityenergy.com

**Counsel for Viridity Energy, Inc. (Participant in “Demand Response Coalition”)**

Justin M. Vickers

Robert Kelter

Environmental Law & Policy Center

35 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600

Chicago, IL 60601

jvickers@elpc.org

rkelter@elpc.org

**Counsel for Environmental Law & Policy Center (“ELPC”)**

Matthew R. Cox

McDonald Hopkins LLC

600 Superior Avenue, East

Suite 2100

Cleveland, OH 44114

mcox@mcdonaldhopkins.com

**Counsel for Council of Smaller Enterprises (“COSE”)**

Garrett A. Stone

Michael K. Lavanga

Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.

1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, NW

8th Floor, West Tower

Washington, DC 20007

gas@bbrslaw.com

mkl@bbrslaw.com

**Counsel for Nucor Steel Marion, Inc.**

Robert J. Triozzi, Director of Law

City of Cleveland

Cleveland City Hall

601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 106

Cleveland, OH 44114-1077

RTriozzi@city.cleveland.oh.us

**Counsel for The City of Cleveland**

Richard L. Sites

General Counsel & Senior Director of Health Policy

Ohio Hospital Association

155 E. Broad Street, 15th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O’Brien

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215

tobrien@bricker.com

**Counsel for the Ohio Hospital Association (“OHA”)**

Cheri B. Cunningham

Director of Law

City of Akron

161 South High Street, Suite 202

Akron, OH 44308

CCunningham@AkronOhio.gov

Joseph Oliker

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 E. State Street, 17th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

joliker@mwncmh.com

**Counsel for the City of Akron**

Christopher Horn

3030 Euclid Avenue, Suite 406

Cleveland, OH 44118

chorn@mcsherrylaw.com

**Counsel for The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland, Cleveland Housing Network and Consumers Protection Association**

Barth E. Royer

Bell & Royer Co., LPA

33 South Grant Avenue

Columbus, OH 43215-3927

BarthRoyer@aol.com

**Counsel for The Cleveland Municipal School District**

Thomas McNamee

Public Utilities Section

Ohio Attorney General's Office

180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us

**Counsel for the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

Mandy Willey

Gregory Price

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us

greg.price@puc.state.oh.us

**Attorney Examiners**

1. The Stipulation was admitted into the record as Company Ex.1. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Company Ex. 1, Stipulation at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. *Id.* at 3. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. IEU-Ohio Post-Hearing Brief at 2. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. EnerNoc Post-Hearing Brief at 7. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. *Id.* at 7. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. Stipulation at 2. The ELR also assists FirstEnergy in satisfying its statutory requirements under Section 4928.66, Revised Code, and the ELR promotes reliability by lowering peak demand. Tr. Vol. I at 65-66. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. Stipulation at 3. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Section 4928.66(A)(1)(b), Revised Code [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. Tr. Vol. I at 311. [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
11. Company Ex. 4 at 6. [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
12. EnerNoc Post-Hearing Brief at 8. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
13. *Id.* at 9. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
14. Tr. Vol. I at 311. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)