

Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2018

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio ¹	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	13,779	2.66	107,797	99%	85%	\$ 1,685,373	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.02	8,490	Appliances	7.8	5.67	4.09
Customer Action Program	54,922	12.29	661,388	100%	100%	\$ 61,047	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,036,450	See Appendix	12.0	2.30	663.09
Direct Load Control	-	-	-	-	-	\$ 15,585	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	46,310	6.11	357,613	86%	70%	\$ 4,447,384	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.01	139,494	See Appendix	7.7	3.58	4.19
Energy Efficient Products	43,840	5.70	589,382	96%	98%	\$ 2,846,239	\$ 0.06	<\$0.01	291,436	See Appendix	13.4	5.53	10.74
Low Income Energy Efficiency	2,341	0.33	37,044	101%	96%	\$ 2,002,270	\$ 0.86	\$ 0.05	1,504	Application	15.8	0.94	0.94
Total Residential	161,193	27.09	1,753,224	95%	91%	\$ 11,057,897	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	1,477,374		10.9	3.12	8.90
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	307.34	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	328	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	21,409	4.85	241,726	100%	100%	\$ 129,116	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	60,265	See Appendix	11.3	2.29	116.74
Customer Action Program - Large	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	See Appendix	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	82,067	14.26	1,114,791	101%	98%	\$ 6,741,364	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	1,198	See Appendix	13.6	3.32	9.16
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	23,340	3.36	305,059	89%	88%	\$ 2,113,560	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	72	See Appendix	13.1	2.41	7.73
Government Tariff Lighting	135	0.03	1,350	100%	100%	\$ 13,800	\$ 0.10	\$ 0.01	9	Project	10.0	6.60	6.05
Mercantile (Approved) ²	23,892	2.52	312,274	92%	223%	\$ 1,356,602	\$ 0.06	<\$0.01	24	Application	13.1	10.70	10.70
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	0%	0%	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	150,843	332.36	1,975,201	97%	110%	\$ 10,354,442	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	61,896		13.1	2.16	10.41
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0.2	0.00	0.2	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	5	Participants	1.0	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	3,763	1.11	75,263	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	4	Project	20.0	N/A	N/A
Total Other	3,763	1.11	75,263	100%	100%	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	9		20.0	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	315,799	360.56	3,803,687	96%	100%	\$ 21,412,339	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	1,539,279		12.0	2.53	9.63
¹ N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
² In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2018	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	16,889,404
2018 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2018 Savings (MWh)	315,799
2018 Achievement (%)	187%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2018	
2018 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance (MWh)	146,905
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2018 (MWh)	1,244,877

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2018	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	1,926,003

Ohio Edison Illuminating Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2018

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio ¹	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	19,781	3.82	154,755	99%	85%	\$ 2,364,883	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.02	12,135	Appliances	7.8	5.84	4.18
Customer Action Program	76,546	17.13	921,781	100%	100%	\$ 128,692	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1,436,833	See Appendix	12.0	2.29	438.46
Direct Load Control	-	-	-	-	-	\$ 25,832	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	76,284	8.96	512,440	87%	82%	\$ 6,503,268	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.01	210,513	See Appendix	6.7	3.52	4.11
Energy Efficient Products	45,834	6.12	614,386	96%	97%	\$ 3,500,443	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	330,059	See Appendix	13.4	5.14	9.16
Low Income Energy Efficiency	3,734	0.52	59,086	100%	96%	\$ 2,929,866	\$ 0.78	\$ 0.05	1,719	Application	15.8	1.02	1.02
Total Residential	222,178	36.54	2,262,448	94%	93%	\$ 15,452,984	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	1,991,259		10.2	2.97	8.29
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	344.75	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	405	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	18,224	3.18	205,763	100%	100%	\$ 137,527	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	87,473	See Appendix	11.3	4.77	86.78
Customer Action Program - Large	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	See Appendix	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	91,766	14.45	1,246,543	110%	101%	\$ 7,956,878	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	1,738	See Appendix	13.6	3.27	8.47
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	71,348	9.70	932,530	93%	102%	\$ 6,055,003	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	220	See Appendix	13.1	2.37	7.78
Government Tariff Lighting	110	0.00	1,104	100%	100%	\$ 15,224	\$ 0.14	\$ 0.01	4	Project	10.0	4.92	3.32
Mercantile (Approved) ²	23,842	3.23	311,612	95%	102%	\$ 1,271,484	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	33	Application	13.1	12.97	12.97
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	0%	0%	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	205,289	375.31	2,697,551	102%	101%	\$ 15,436,116	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	89,873		13.1	2.69	9.26
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	12,593	3.65	251,869	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1	Project	20.0	N/A	N/A
Total Other	12,593	3.65	251,869	100%	100%	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	1		20.0	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	440,061	415.50	5,211,868	98%	97%	\$ 30,889,100	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	2,081,133		11.8	2.82	8.78
¹ N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
² In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2018	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	21,889,219
2018 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2018 Savings (MWh)	440,061
2018 Achievement (%)	201%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2018	
2018 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance (MWh)	221,169
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2018 (MWh)	1,115,410

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2018	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	2,101,747

Toledo Edison Company Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2018

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio ¹	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	4,952	0.96	38,738	99%	85%	\$ 630,991	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.02	3,028	Appliances	7.8	5.37	3.93
Customer Action Program	22,244	5.01	267,873	100%	100%	\$ 45,742	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	405,682	See Appendix	12.0	2.28	359.09
Direct Load Control	-	-	-	-	-	\$ 4,125	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	14,930	1.92	139,638	85%	68%	\$ 1,875,375	\$ 0.13	\$ 0.01	55,223	See Appendix	9.4	2.92	3.85
Energy Efficient Products	14,933	1.90	202,934	95%	95%	\$ 1,002,040	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	93,081	See Appendix	13.6	6.56	10.44
Low Income Energy Efficiency	1,798	0.25	28,455	102%	97%	\$ 1,422,422	\$ 0.79	\$ 0.05	953	Application	15.8	1.01	1.01
Total Residential	58,857	10.03	677,638	95%	91%	\$ 4,980,694	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	557,967		11.5	2.89	7.64
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	150.23		N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	100	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	6,986	1.50	78,873	100%	100%	\$ 41,857	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	26,030	See Appendix	11.3	1.25	115.71
Customer Action Program - Large	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	See Appendix	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	41,294	6.19	560,939	92%	98%	\$ 3,349,310	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	775	See Appendix	13.6	3.29	8.96
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	33,526	5.12	438,193	92%	98%	\$ 3,149,119	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	124	See Appendix	13.1	2.59	7.55
Government Tariff Lighting	45	0.01	446	101%	0%	\$ 1,684	\$ 0.04	<\$0.01	5	Project	10.0	17.10	17.10
Mercantile (Approved) ²	2,924	0.36	38,223	97%	224%	\$ 159,802	\$ 0.05	<\$0.01	9	Application	13.1	12.28	12.28
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	0%	0%	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Application	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	84,775	163.41	1,116,674	92%	102%	\$ 6,701,771	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	27,043		13.2	2.68	9.04
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0	0.00	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	3,507	1.07	70,147	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	4	Project	20.0	N/A	N/A
Total Other	3,507	1.07	70,147	100%	100%	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	4		20.0	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	147,140	174.51	1,864,459	93%	97%	\$ 11,682,466	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	585,014		12.7	2.76	8.44
¹ N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
² In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2018	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	6,797,079
2018 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2018 Savings (MWh)	147,140
2018 Achievement (%)	216%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2018	
2018 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance (MWh)	79,169
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2018 (MWh)	545,534

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2018	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	3,765,377

FirstEnergy Energy Efficiency Savings Summary

1 Incremental Savings and Expenditures from Programs in Year 2018

	Ex Ante Gross Savings			Realization Rate		Actual Expenditures			Participation		Weighted Program Measure Life	TRC Test Ratio ¹	PAC Test Ratio
	A	B	C	D	E	F	G=F/(A*1,000)	H=F/(C*1000)	I	J	K=C/A	L	M
	First Year Annual Energy Savings (MWh)	First Year Peak Demand Savings (MW)	Lifetime Savings (MWh)	Energy Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Demand Savings (Ex Post Gross/Ex Ante Gross)	Program Costs (\$)	Ex Ante First Year Cost Per First Year Annual Savings (\$/kWh)	Ex Ante Cost per Lifetime Savings (\$/kWh)	Participation Number	Unit Description (See Evaluation Report for Details)	Years	C/E Score By Program	C/E Score By Program
Residential Programs													
Appliance Turn-In	38,512	7.44	301,290	99%	85%	\$ 4,681,246	\$ 0.12	\$ 0.02	23,653	Appliances	7.8	5.71	4.12
Customer Action Program	153,713	34.42	1,851,042	100%	100%	\$ 235,481	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	2,878,965	See Appendix	12.0	2.29	481.28
Direct Load Control	-	-	-	-	-	\$ 45,541	N/A	N/A	-	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Efficient Homes	137,524	16.99	1,009,690	86%	76%	\$ 12,826,027	\$ 0.09	\$ 0.01	405,230	See Appendix	7.3	3.44	4.10
Energy Efficient Products	104,607	13.71	1,406,702	96%	97%	\$ 7,348,722	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	714,576	See Appendix	13.4	5.47	9.95
Low Income Energy Efficiency	7,873	1.10	124,585	101%	96%	\$ 6,354,557	\$ 0.81	\$ 0.05	4,176	Applications	15.8	0.99	0.99
Total Residential	442,228	73.66	4,693,309	95%	92%	\$ 31,491,575	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	4,026,600		10.6	3.01	8.40
Business Programs													
C&I Demand Response Program	0	802.32	N/A	NA	NA	\$ -	N/A	N/A	833	Participants	N/A	N/A	N/A
Customer Action Program - Small	46,618	9.53	526,363	100%	100%	\$ 308,500	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	173,768	See Appendix	11.3	2.46	103.24
Customer Action Program - Large	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	See Appendix	N/A	N/A	N/A
Energy Solutions for Business - Small	215,126	34.90	2,922,273	103%	99%	\$ 18,047,552	\$ 0.08	<\$0.01	3,711	See Appendix	13.6	3.29	8.82
Energy Solutions for Business - Large	128,215	18.17	1,675,782	92%	98%	\$ 11,317,682	\$ 0.09	<\$0.01	416	See Appendix	13.1	2.43	7.71
Government Tariff Lighting	290	0.04	2,899	100%	100%	\$ 30,707	\$ 0.11	\$ 0.01	18	Project	10.0	6.61	5.30
Mercantile (Approved) ²	50,658	6.12	662,109	93%	160%	\$ 2,787,888	\$ 0.06	<\$0.01	66	Applications	13.1	11.82	11.82
Mercantile (Pending)	0	0.00	0	0%	0%	\$ -	N/A	N/A	0	Applications	N/A	N/A	N/A
Total Business	440,907	871.08	5,789,426	98%	105%	\$ 32,492,329	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	178,812		13.1	2.48	9.58
Other Programs													
Energy Special Improvement District	-	-	-	-	-	\$ -	N/A	N/A	-	Project	N/A	N/A	N/A
Smart Grid Modernization Initiative	0	0.00	0.2	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	5.0	Participants	1.0	N/A	N/A
T&D Improvements	19,864	5.82	397,280	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	9	Project	20.0	N/A	N/A
Total Other	19,864	5.82	397,280	N/A	N/A	\$ -	<\$0.01	<\$0.01	14		20.0	N/A	N/A
Portfolio Total	903,000	950.57	10,880,015	96%	98%	\$ 63,983,904	\$ 0.07	<\$0.01	4,205,426		12.0	2.70	9.00
¹ N/A reflects a TRC score is not applicable for that program.													
² In line with the Commission's Orders in 10-834-EL-POR and 12-665-EL-UNC, the Companies' evaluator has calculated Mercantile program cost effectiveness using the Utility Cost Test (UCT), not the Total Resource Cost (TRC) Test													

2 Information Relative to Statutory Targets for Year 2018	
3 year baseline retail normalized (mercantile, weather, opt-out, etc.) sales. (MWh)	45,575,702
2018 Annual Benchmark Target (%)	1%
2018 Savings (MWh)	903,000
2018 Achievement (%)	198%

3 Banked Savings in Year 2018	
2018 Excess Savings Banked Toward Future Compliance (MWh)	447,243
Total Banked Savings Remaining After 2018 (MWh)	2,905,821

4 Opt Out - Three year baseline in 2018	
Total Opt Out load (MWh)	7,793,127