Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for an Increase in Gas Distribution Rates | ))) | Case No. 17-1139-GA-AIR |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Tariff Approval | ))) | Case No. 17-1140-GA-ATA |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority | ))) | Case No. 17-1141-GA-AAM |

**Motion of Ohio Gas Company to Strike Objection 2 of the Objections to the PUCO Staff’s Report of Investigation by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

**Frank P. Darr** (Reg. No. 0025469)

 (Counsel of Record)

**Matthew R. Pritchard** (Reg. No. 0088070)

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

fdarr@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

December 29, 2017 Attorneys for Ohio Gas Company

Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for an Increase in Gas Distribution Rates | ))) | Case No. 17-1139-GA-AIR |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Tariff Approval | )) | Case No. 17-1140-GA-ATA |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority | ))) | Case No. 17-1141-GA-AAM |

Motion of Ohio Gas Company to Strike Objection 2 of the Objections to the PUCO Staff’s Report of Investigation by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

Under Rule 4901-1-12 and Rule 4901-1-28, Ohio Administrative Code, Ohio Gas Company moves for an order striking Objection 2 of the Objections to the PUCO Staff’s Report of Investigation by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel because the objection is not specific. The reasons supporting this Motion are set out in the accompanying Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Frank P. Darr*

**Frank P. Darr** (Reg. No. 0025469)

 (Counsel of Record)

**Matthew R. Pritchard** (Reg. No. 0088070)

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

fdarr@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

Attorneys for Ohio Gas Company

Before

**The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for an Increase in Gas Distribution Rates | ))) | Case No. 17-1139-GA-AIR |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Tariff Approval | )) | Case No. 17-1140-GA-ATA |
|  |  |  |
| In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority | ))) | Case No. 17-1141-GA-AAM |

Memorandum in Support

1. **Introduction**

On November 22, 2017, the Report of Investigation (“Staff Report”) in this case recommended that the rate of return be set in a range of 8.5% to 9.5%. In an objection to the Staff Report, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (“OCC”) complains that the recommendation is “flawed,” but provides no explanation for this complaint. Because the objection fails to comply with the requirement that an objection must be specific, the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) should strike the objection.

1. **Statement of Facts**

On May 31, 2017, Ohio Gas Company (“Ohio Gas”) filed an application to increase rates with the Commission. As the Application of Ohio Gas demonstrates, its capital structure consists solely of equity; it reports no long term debt or preferred stock. Application, Schedule D-1 (May 31, 2017). Based on a detailed review of the current cost of capital, Ohio Gas requested that the return on equity (and because of the capital structure, the rate of return) be set at 9.0%. *Id.*, Direct Testimony of Joseph G. Bowser on Behalf of Ohio Gas Company *passim* (May 31, 2017).

On November 22, 2017, the Staff of the Commission filed its Report of Investigation (“Staff Report”). The Staff Report agreed that 9.0% was a reasonable estimate of the return on equity and recommended a range of rate of return of 8.5% to 9.5%. Staff Report at 13 (Nov. 22, 2017). It did not (and as discussed below was not permitted to) propose any adjustment to the capital structure contained in Schedule D-1 of the Application.

Under Rule 4901-1-28, Ohio Administrative Code (“OAC”), the OCC filed objections to the Staff Report’s recommendations including the recommendation on rate of return. Objections to the PUCO Staff’s Report of Investigation by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel at 2-4 (Dec. 22, 2017). Its second objection, in full, is:

The Staff Report unreasonably supports Ohio Gas’s proposed rate of return charged to Ohio Gas’s customers, which is based on accepting the capital structure of 100 percent equity proposed by the Applicant. Using the 100% equity capital structure is flawed and unjust and unreasonable for ratemaking purposes.

1. **Argument**

R.C. 4909.19 provides that the Commission must undertake an investigation of an application to increase rates. Upon publication of the report of the investigation, parties may file objections within 30 days. *See, also*, Rule 4901-1-28(B), OAC.

 The purpose of the objections is to set the issues for hearing in a contested case.

The objections to the report … shall frame the issues in the proceeding, although the commission, the legal director, the deputy legal director, or the attorney examiner may designate additional issues or areas of inquiry. Unless otherwise ordered by the commission, the legal director, the deputy legal director, or the attorney examiner, all material findings and conclusions set forth in the report to which no objection has been filed shall be deemed admitted for purposes of the proceeding.

Rule 4901-1-28(C), OAC.

To afford parties adequate notice of the issues that will be addressed in the hearing, Rule 4901-1-28(B) further provides, “All objections must be specific. Any objections that fail to meet this requirement may be stricken upon motion of any party or the commission staff or upon motion of the commission, the legal director, the deputy legal director, or the attorney examiner.” The requirement that objections be specific is “to convey what is actually being placed at issue.” Entry at 2 (Dec. 1, 2017). To that end, “[t]he specificity requirement in Rule 4901-1-28 O.A.C. does necessitate that the party filing the objections inform the staff and other parties of the precise area of disagreement with the position taken in the staff report.” *In the Matter of the Application of Ohio-American Water Company for Authority to Increase its Rates for Water Service Provided to its Entire Service Area*, Case No. 01-626-WW-AIR, Entry ¶ 7 (Jan. 4, 2002) (“*Ohio-American Water*”).

In its second objection, OCC asserts that “using the 100% equity capital structure is flawed,” but provides no explanation of the supposed “flaw” contained in the report. The objection’s “bare statement” of a flaw “does not sufficiently inform the parties as to the area of disagreement.” *Ohio-American Water* ¶ 7.

Moreover, the supposed flaw cannot be the capital structure itself because the Commission cannot approve rates without applying a 100% equity capital structure in this case. When the Commission sets rates under R.C. 4909.15(E)(2), the Commission must account for the “actual cost of debt” in setting a reasonable rate of return. Under this ratemaking provision, the Commission cannot approve a “hypothetical capital structure.” *General Tel. Co. of Ohio v. Pub. Utils. Comm’n of Ohio*, 174 Ohio St. 525 (1963); *In the Matter of the Application of The Cincinnati Gas and Elec. Co. for Authority to Increase its Rates for Electric Service to all Jurisdictional Customers*, Case Nos. 83-1528-EL-AIR, *et al.*, Opinion and Order (Nov. 20, 1984). As the Application of Ohio Gas demonstrates, it has no long term debt or preferred stock. Application, Schedule D-1. Thus, the only capital structure permitted by Ohio law in setting rates for Ohio Gas is one that is based on 100% equity. Accordingly, there is no “flaw” in the Staff Report’s use of a 100% equity capital to determine the just and reasonable rates of Ohio Gas.

1. **Conclusion**

OCC’s second objection fails to satisfy the requirement that objections must be “specific.” Because it fails to state why it believes the Staff Report’s use of a 100% equity capital structure is “flawed,” the Commission should grant this motion to strike the objection.

Respectfully submitted,

*/s/ Frank P. Darr*

**Frank P. Darr** (Reg. No. 0025469)

 (Counsel of Record)

**Matthew R. Pritchard** (Reg. No. 0088070)

McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC

21 East State Street, 17TH Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

Telephone: (614) 469-8000

Telecopier: (614) 469-4653

fdarr@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

mpritchard@mwncmh.com

(willing to accept service by e-mail)

Attorneys for Ohio Gas Company

**Certificate of Service**

In accordance with Rule 4901-1-05, Ohio Administrative Code, the PUCO’s e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document upon the following parties. In addition, I hereby certify that a service copy of the foregoing *Motion of Ohio Gas Company to Strike Objection 2 of the Objections to the PUCO Staff’s Report of Investigation by the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel*, as sent by, or on behalf of, the undersigned counsel for Ohio Gas to the following parties of record this 29th day of December 2017, *via* electronic transmission.

*/s/ Frank P. Darr*

Frank P. Darr

**Kevin F. Moore** (Reg. No. 0089228)

(Counsel of Record)

Assistant Consumers’ Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel

65 East State Street, 7th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-4203

Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov

**On Behalf of the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel**

**Jodi Bair** (Reg. No. 0062921)

**Robert Eubanks** (Reg. No. 0073386)

Assistant Attorneys General

Office of the Ohio Attorney General

30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

jodi.bair@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**On Behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio**

**Sarah Parrot**

**Patricia Schabo**

Legal Department

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

180 East Broad Street, 12th Floor

Columbus, OH 43215

sarah.parrot@puc.state.oh.us

Patricia.schabo@puc.state.oh.us

**Attorney Examiners**