



155 East Broad Street
20th Floor
Columbus, Ohio, 43215

o: 614-222-1334
f: 614-222-1337

October 4, 2016

VIA ELECTRONIC FILING

Barcy McNeal
Ohio Power Siting Board Docketing Division
180 East Broad Street, 11th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3716

Re: Duke Energy Ohio 5680 - 138kV Todhunter to Nickel Rebuild, PUCO Case No. 16-1759-EL-BLN

Dear Ms. McNeal:

Please find attached a letter from the Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) addressing the plant and animal life that may be affected by the project. This letter, dated October 4, 2016, had not been received at the time the Application was filed on August 22, 2016.

Sincerely,

Jeanne W. Kingery
Jeanne W. Kingery
Associate General Counsel



Ohio Department of Natural Resources

JOHN R. KASICH, GOVERNOR

JAMES ZEHRINGER, DIRECTOR

Office of Real Estate

Paul R. Baldrige, Chief
2045 Morse Road – Bldg. E-2
Columbus, OH 43229
Phone: (614) 265-6649
Fax: (614) 267-4764

October 4, 2016

Cori Jansing
Cardno
11121 Canal Road
Cincinnati, Ohio 45241

Re: 16-625; 5680 Todhunter to Nickel Rebuild & 3283 Line Removal Project

Project: The proposed project involves the removal and replacement of approximately 3.68 miles of existing transmission line.

Location: The proposed project is located in Lemon and Turtle Creek Townships, Butler and Warren Counties, Ohio.

The Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) has completed a review of the above referenced project. These comments were generated by an inter-disciplinary review within the Department. These comments have been prepared under the authority of the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 661 et seq.), the National Environmental Policy Act, the Coastal Zone Management Act, Ohio Revised Code and other applicable laws and regulations. These comments are also based on ODNR's experience as the state natural resource management agency and do not supersede or replace the regulatory authority of any local, state or federal agency nor relieve the applicant of the obligation to comply with any local, state or federal laws or regulations.

Natural Heritage Database: The Natural Heritage Database has no data at or within a one mile radius of the project area.

A review of the Ohio Natural Heritage Database indicates there are no records of state endangered or threatened plants or animals within the project area. There are also no records of state potentially threatened plants, special interest or species of concern animals, or any federally listed species. In addition, we are unaware of any unique ecological sites, geologic features, animal assemblages, scenic rivers, state wildlife areas, state nature preserves, state or national parks, state or national forests, national wildlife refuges, or other protected natural areas within the project area. The review was performed on the project area you specified in your request as well as an additional one mile radius. Records searched date from 1980.

Please note that Ohio has not been completely surveyed and we rely on receiving information from many sources. Therefore, a lack of records for any particular area is not a statement that rare species or unique features are absent from that area. Although all types of plant communities have been surveyed, we only maintain records on the highest quality areas.

Fish and Wildlife: The Division of Wildlife (DOW) has the following comments.

The DOW recommends that impacts to streams, wetlands and other water resources be avoided and minimized to the fullest extent possible, and that best management practices be utilized to minimize erosion and sedimentation.

The project is within the range of the Indiana bat (*Myotis sodalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered species. The following species of trees have relatively high value as potential Indiana bat roost trees: shagbark hickory (*Carya ovata*), shellbark hickory (*Carya laciniosa*), bitternut hickory (*Carya cordiformis*), black ash (*Fraxinus nigra*), green ash (*Fraxinus pennsylvanica*), white ash (*Fraxinus americana*), shingle oak (*Quercus imbricaria*), northern red oak (*Quercus rubra*), slippery elm (*Ulmus rubra*), American elm (*Ulmus americana*), eastern cottonwood (*Populus deltoides*), silver maple (*Acer saccharinum*), sassafras (*Sassafras albidum*), post oak (*Quercus stellata*), and white oak (*Quercus alba*). Indiana bat roost trees consists of trees that include dead and dying trees with exfoliating bark, crevices, or cavities in upland areas or riparian corridors and living trees with exfoliating bark, cavities, or hollow areas formed from broken branches or tops. However, Indiana bats are also dependent on the forest structure surrounding roost trees. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area, the DOW recommends trees be conserved. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area and trees must be cut, the DOW recommends cutting occur between October 1 and March 31. If suitable trees must be cut during the summer months, the DOW recommends a net survey be conducted between June 1 and August 15, prior to any cutting. Net surveys should incorporate either nine net nights per square 0.5 kilometer of project area, or four net nights per kilometer for linear projects. If no tree removal is proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the club shell (*Pleurobema clava*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the rayed bean (*Villosa fabalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the snuffbox (*Epioblasma triquetra*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the washboard (*Megaloniais nervosa*), a state endangered mussel, the threehorn wartyback (*Obliquaria reflexa*), a state threatened mussel, the black sandshell (*Ligumia recta*), a state threatened mussel, and the fawnsfoot (*Truncilla donaciformis*), a state threatened mussel. This project must not have an impact on freshwater native mussels at the project site. This applies to both listed and non-listed species. Per the Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol (2016), all Group 2, 3, and 4 streams (Appendix A) require a mussel survey. Per the Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol, Group 1 streams (Appendix A) and unlisted streams with a watershed of 10 square miles or larger above the point of impact should be assessed using the Reconnaissance Survey for Unionid Mussels (Appendix B) to determine if mussels are present. Mussel surveys may be recommended for these streams as well. This is further explained within the Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol. Therefore, if in-water work is planned in any stream that meets any of the above criteria, the DOW recommends the applicant provide information to indicate no mussel impacts will occur. If this is not possible, the DOW recommends a professional malacologist conduct a mussel survey in the project area. If mussels that cannot be avoided are found in the project area, as a last resort, the DOW recommends a professional malacologist collect and relocate the mussels to suitable and similar habitat upstream of the project site. Mussel surveys and any subsequent mussel relocation should be done in accordance with the Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol. The Ohio Mussel Survey Protocol (2016) can be found at:

<http://wildlife.ohiodnr.gov/portals/wildlife/pdfs/licenses%20&%20permits/OH%20Mussel%20Survey%20Protocol.pdf>

The project is within the range of the northern brook lamprey (*Ichthyomyzon fossor*), a state endangered fish, the goldeye (*Hiodon alosoides*), a state endangered fish, the mountain brook lamprey (*Ichthyomyzon greeleyi*), a state endangered fish, the bigeye shiner (*Notropis boops*) a state threatened fish, the American eel (*Anguilla rostrata*), a state threatened fish, and the paddlefish (*Polyodon spathula*) a state threatened fish. The DOW recommends no in-water work in perennial streams at least April 15 to June 30 to reduce impacts to indigenous aquatic species and their habitat. If no in-water work is proposed, this project is not likely to impact these or other aquatic species.

The project is within the range of the eastern massasauga (*Sistrurus catenatus*), a state endangered and a federal candidate snake species. The eastern massasauga uses a range of habitats including wet prairies, fens, and other wetlands, as well as drier upland habitat. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the spotted turtle (*Clemmys guttata*), a state threatened species. This species prefers fens, bogs and marshes, but is also known to inhabit wet prairies, meadows, pond edges, wet woods, and the shallow sluggish waters of small streams and ditches. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the Kirtland's snake (*Clonophis kirtlandii*), a state threatened species. This secretive species prefers wet fields and meadows. Due to the location and the type of habitat present at the project site, and within the vicinity of the project area, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the cave salamander (*Eurycea lucifuga*), a state endangered species. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the upland sandpiper (*Bartramia longicauda*), a state endangered bird. Nesting upland sandpipers utilize dry grasslands including native grasslands, seeded grasslands, grazed and ungrazed pasture, hayfields, and grasslands established through the Conservation Reserve Program (CRP). If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of April 15 to July 31. If this type of habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the northern harrier (*Circus cyaneus*), a state endangered bird. This is a common migrant and winter species. Nesters are much rarer, although they occasionally breed in large marshes and grasslands. Harriers often nest in loose colonies. The female builds a nest out of sticks on the ground, often on top of a mound. Harriers hunt over grasslands. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 15 to August 1. If this habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

There are records within Millers Creek for the Sloan's crayfish (*Orconectes sloanii*), a state threatened species. If there are no impacts proposed to Millers Creek, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the Kramer's cave beetle (*Pseudanophthalmus krameri*), a state endangered species, and the Ohio cave beetle (*Pseudanophthalmus ohioensis*), a state endangered

species. These species are found only in caves. The Ohio Cave Protection Law, Section 1517.21 of the Ohio Revised Code, protects caves from impacts, in turn, protecting the habitat of these species. Therefore, the project is not likely to have an impact on these species.

Due to the potential of impacts to federally listed species, as well as to state listed species, we recommend that this project be coordinated with the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service.

Water Resources: The Division of Water Resources has the following comment.

The local floodplain administrator should be contacted concerning the possible need for any floodplain permits or approvals for this project. Your local floodplain administrator contact information can be found at the website below.

<http://water.ohiodnr.gov/water-use-planning/floodplain-management#PUB>

ODNR appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments. Please contact John Kessler at (614) 265-6621 if you have questions about these comments or need additional information.

John Kessler
ODNR Office of Real Estate
2045 Morse Road, Building E-2
Columbus, Ohio 43229-6693
John.Kessler@dnr.state.oh.us