BEFORE

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan, Accounting Modifications and Tariffs for Generation Service. | ))))))) | Case No. 14-841-EL-SSO |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio for Authority to Amend its Certified Supplier Tariff, P.U.C.O. No. 20. | ))) | Case No. 14-842-EL-ATA |

|  |
| --- |
|  |

# DUKE ENERGY OHIO’S MEMORANDUM CONTRA

# JOINT MOTION FOR A PREHEARING CONFERENCE TO ADDRESS PENDING MOTIONS AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RULING

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

 Pursuant to the provisions of O.A.C. 4901-1-12(C), Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (Duke Energy Ohio or Company) hereby files its memorandum contra (Memorandum Contra) a Joint Motion for a Prehearing Conference to Address Pending Motions and Request for Expedited Ruling (Joint Motion), filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission) on July 28, 2014, by the several of the intervenors in these proceedings (Joint Movants).[[1]](#footnote-1)

 While Duke Energy Ohio is ready to participate in a prehearing conference, should the Commission determine that such a conference is necessary, Duke Energy Ohio disagrees with the rationale for the Joint Motion and with the requested prehearing conference date.

Joint Movants seek to force the Commission to rule on all pending motions on Joint Movants’ schedule, rather than allowing the Commission to proceed as it deems appropriate. Although the Commission is indisputably aware of the motions in question, as well as their content, Joint Movants have chosen to detail all of those filings yet again. This approach is a waste of the Commission’s valuable time and resources.

Joint Movants, in attempting to support this tactic, also misstate reality in their attempt to summarize the arguments in pending motions. Most egregious is their false assertion that Duke Energy Ohio “has refused to provide most intervenors with information that it alone has determined deserves confidential treatment. The PUCO’s rules were promulgated to prevent such actions.”[[2]](#footnote-2) The truth is that:

* Duke Energy Ohio has refused to release its proprietary information under contractual terms that experience has shown to be ineffective in preventing misuse of such information.
* OCC has refused even to consider signing a confidentiality agreement that differs from the version previously used.
* Negotiations over the terms of a confidentiality agreement continued with another party, with both sides compromising to reach a reasonable outcome.
* Without an effective confidentiality agreement, the information that Duke Energy Ohio believes to be proprietary cannot be released.
* As of the filing of the Joint Motion, only threeof the fourteen movants had even requested a confidentiality agreement with the Company.[[3]](#footnote-3) The circumstances involving OCC with regard to terms of a confidentiality agreement are well known and will not be restated here. The only other movants to have sought a confidentiality agreement have yet to provide substantive comments.
* As of the filing of this Joint Motion, only five of the fourteen movants had tendered discovery upon Duke Energy Ohio and thus have affirmatively sought any information, whether confidential or public, that would assist them in evaluating the Company’s application from the perspective of their individual business interests.

It is not, as Joint Movants assert, that Duke Energy Ohio refuses to provide the agreement. Rather, of those few Joint Movants that have even broached the subject of a confidentiality agreement, they either refuse to compromise or have not followed up with the Company, and it is under these circumstances that Duke Energy Ohio refuses to release its confidential information publicly.

Duke Energy Ohio does not disagree that a prehearing conference is one method by which the Commission could decide these issues. However, it seems unlikely, after the plethora of motions that have been filed, that any more argument is necessary. The more typical written order would suffice.

If the Commission does wish to schedule a prehearing conference, sufficient notice would be necessary in order to ensure that all interested parties have the opportunity to have counsel present. Joint Movants have asked the Commission to schedule such a conference for the week of July 28, 2014. As the Motion was only filed on July 28, 2014, this is an astonishing request. Given such short notice, many of Duke Energy Ohio’s necessary participants would not be available.

Duke Energy Ohio respectfully submits that the Commission should deny the Joint Motion.

Respectfully submitted,

DUKE ENERGY OHIO, INC.

 /s/ Jeanne W. Kingery

Amy B. Spiller (Counsel of Record)

Deputy General Counsel

Rocco O. D’Ascenzo

Associate General Counsel

Jeanne W. Kingery

Associate General Counsel

Elizabeth H. Watts

Associate General Counsel

139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main

P.O. Box 961

Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960

(513) 287-4359 (telephone)

 (513) 287-4385 (facsimile)

Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com (e-mail)

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

 I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing was delivered by U.S. mail (postage prepaid), personal, or electronic mail, on this 30th day of July, 2014, to the parties listed below.

 /s/ Jeanne W. Kingery

Jeanne W. Kingery

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Steven BeelerThomas LindgrenRyan O’RourkeAssistant Attorneys GeneralPublic Utilities Section180 East Broad St., 6th FloorColumbus, Ohio 43215Steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.usThomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.usRyan.orouke@puc.state.oh.us**Counsel for Staff of the Commission** |  | David F. BoehmMichael L. KurtzJody M. Kyler CohnBoehm, Kurtz & Lowry36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510Cincinnati, Ohio 45202dboehm@BKLlawfirm.commkurtz@BKLlawfirm.comjkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com**Counsel for the Ohio Energy Group** |
| Kevin R. Schmidt88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770Columbus, Ohio 43215schmidt@sppgrp.com**Counsel for the Energy Professionals of Ohio** |  | Mark A. HaydenJacob A. McDermottScott J. CastoFirstEnergy Service Company76 South Main StreetAkron, Ohio 44308haydenm@firstenergycorp.comjmcdermott@firstenergycorp.comscasto@firstenergycorp.com**Counsel for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.** |
| Maureen R. GradyJoseph P. SerioEdmund “Tad” BergerOffice of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.govJoseph.serio@occ.ohio.govEdmund.berger@occ.ohio.gov**Counsel for the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel** |  | Judi L. SobeckiThe Dayton Power and Light Company1065 Woodman DriveDayton, Ohio 45432Judi.sobecki@aes.com**Counsel for The Dayton Power and Light Company** |
| Kimberly W. BojkoMallory M. MohlerCarpenter Lipps & Leland LLP280 Plaza, Suite 1300280 North High StreetColumbus, Ohio 43215Bojko@carpenterlipps.comMohler@carpenterlipps.com**Counsel for the Ohio Manufacturers’ Association** |  | Joseph OlikerMatthew White6100 Emerald ParkwayDublin, Ohio 43016joliker@igsenergy.commswhite@igsenergy.com**Counsel for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.** |
| Joseph M. ClarkDirect Energy21 East State Street, 19th FloorColumbus, Ohio 43215joseph.clark@directenergy.com**Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC** |  | Gerit F. HullEckert Seamans Cherin & Mellot, LLC1717 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.12th FloorWashington, DC 20006ghull@eckertseamans.com**Counsel for Direct Energy Services, LLC and Direct Energy Business, LLC** |
| Samuel C. RandazzoFrank P. DarrMatthew R. PritchardMcNees Wallace & Nurick LLC21 East State Street, 17th FloorColumbus, Ohio 43215sam@mwncmh.comfdarr@mwncmh.commpritchard@mwncmh.com**Counsel for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio** |  | Colleen L. MooneyCathryn N. LoucasOhio Partners for Affordable Energy231 West Lima StreetFindlay, Ohio 45839-1793cmooney@ohiopartners.orgcloucas@ohiopartners.org**Counsel for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy** |
| Trent Dougherty1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449tdougherty@theOEC.org**Counsel for the Ohio Environmental Council** |  | Steven T. NourseMatthew J. SatterwhiteYazen AlamiAmerican Electric Power Service Corporation1 Riverside Plaza 29th FloorColumbus, Ohio 43215stnourse@aep.commjsatterwhite@aep.comyalami@aep.com**Counsel for Ohio Power Company** |
| Andrew J. SondermanMargeaux KimbroughKegler Brown Hill & Ritter LPACapitol Square, Suite 180065 East State StreetColumbus, Ohio 43215-4294asonderman@keglerbrown.commkimbrough@keglerbrown.com**Counsel for People Working Cooperatively, Inc.** |  | Christopher J. AllweinTodd M. WilliamsWilliams Allwein and Moser, LLC1500 West Third Avenue, Suite 330Columbus, Ohio 43212callwein@wamenergylaw.comtoddm@wamenergylaw.com**Counsel for the Sierra Club** |
| Rebecca L. HusseyCarpenter Lipps & Leland LLP280 Plaza, Suite 1300280 North High StreetColumbus, Ohio 43215Hussey@carpenterlipps.com**Counsel for The Kroger Company** |  | Douglas E. Hart441 Vine StreetSuite 4192Cincinnati, Ohio 45202dhart@douglasehart.com**Counsel for The Greater Cincinnati Health Council** |
| M. Howard Petricoff Michael J. SettineriGretchen L. PetrucciVorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP52 East Gay StreetP.O.Box 1008Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008mhpetricoff@vorys.commjsettineri@vorys.comglpetrucci@vorys.com**Counsel for Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Exelon Generation Company,****LLC** |  | Cynthia Fonner BradyExelon Business Services Company4300 Winfield RoadWarrenville, Illinois 60555Cynthia.brady@constellation.com**For Constellation NewEnegy, Inc.** |
| David I. FeinVice President, State Government Affairs - EastExelon Corporation10 South Dearborn Street, 47th FloorChicago, Illinois 60603David.fein@exeloncorp.com**For Exelon Corporation** |  | Lael CampbellExelon101 Constitution Avenue, NWWashington, DC 2001Lael.Campbell@constellation.com**For Constellation NewEnergy, Inc.** |
| M. Howard Petricoff Special Assistant Attorney GeneralVorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP52 East Gay StreetP.O. Box 1008Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008mhpetricoff@vorys.com**Counsel for Miami University and the University of Cincinnati** |  | M. Howard Petricoff Michael J. SettineriGretchen L. PetrucciVorys, Sater, Seymour, and Pease, LLP52 East Gay StreetP.O.Box 1008Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008mhpetricoff@vorys.commjsettineri@vorys.comglpetrucci@vorys.com**Counsel for the Retail Energy Supply Association** |
| Nicholas McDanielEnvironmental Law & Policy Center1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201Columbus, Ohio 43212NMcDaniel@elpc.org**Counsel for the Environmental Law &****Policy Center** |  | Gregory J. PoulosEnerNOC, Inc.471 E. Broad Street, Suite 1520Columbus, Ohio 43215gpoulos@enernoc.com**Counsel for EnerNOC, Inc.** |
| Samantha WilliamsNatural Resources Defense Council20 N. Wacker Drive, Suite 1600Chicago, Illinois 60606swilliams@nrdc.org**Counsel for the Natural Resources Defense Council** |  | Thomas J. O'BrienBricker & Eckler LLP100 South Third StreetColumbus, Ohio 43215-4291tobrien@bricker.com**Counsel for the City of Cincinnati** |
| Rick D. Chamberlain Behrens, Wheeler, & Chamberlain6 N.E. 63rd Street, Suite 400Oklahoma City, OK 73105rchamberlain@okenergylaw.com**Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.** |  | Donald L. MasonMichael R. TravenRoetzel & Andress, LPA155 E. Broad Street, 12th FloorColumbus, Ohio 43215dmason@ralaw.commtraven@ralaw.com**Counsel for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam’s East, Inc.** |

1. The Joint Movants comprise the City of Cincinnati, Constellation NewEnergy Inc., Environmental Law and Policy Center, Exelon Generation Company LLC, Industrial Energy Users-Ohio, Interstate Gas Supply, Inc., the Kroger Company, Natural Resources Defense Council, the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (OCC), Ohio Environmental Council, Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy, People Working Cooperatively, Retail Energy Supply Association, and Sierra Club. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Joint Motion, pg. 3. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. As the Company had standard confidentiality agreements available at the technical conference, additional Movants may have also picked up copies. However, no other Movants have discussed the matter with Company counsel. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)