

**Duke Energy Ohio  
PUCO Case No. 20-1487-EL-BNR  
STAFF First Set of Data Requests  
Date Received: October 2, 2020**

**STAFF-DR-02-002**

**REQUEST:**

No ODNR coordination letter for listed species was included in the application, and only the coordination letter response from the USFWS was referenced. Did you coordinate with the ODNR for this project? If so, have you received a response? If yes, please submit the response from the ODNR to Staff and docket in the case docket. If not, please indicate when you anticipate receiving a response.

**RESPONSE:** Yes, Duke Energy Ohio has coordinated with ODNR for this project. Please see STAFF-DR-02-002 Attachment A and STAFF-DR-02-002 Attachment B.

**PERSON RESPONSIBLE:** Dane Vandewater



## OHIO DIVISION OF WILDLIFE GUIDANCE FOR BAT SURVEYS AND TREE CLEARING JUNE 2020

### Agency Contacts:

**ODNR-DOW Permit Coordinator:** Wildlife.Permits@dnr.state.oh.us, (614) 265-6315

**ODNR-DOW Bat Survey Coordinator:** Sarah Stankavich, sarah.stankavich@dnr.state.oh.us, (614) 265-6764

Due to the evolving situation with COVID-19, we are temporarily suspending bat-handling activities until more is known about the risk to North American bats. This document has been updated with new state guidance for the 2020 field season only, or until bat-handling activities are reinstated. These guidelines replace previous guidelines released in March 2020.

*This guidance applies to state recommendations only. Contact the USFWS to determine if federal consultation is also necessary to comply with federal law.*

### Ohio Mist Net Surveys:

Mist-netting for presence/absence surveys, education events, or research activities will not be authorized for the 2020 season.

### Ohio Acoustic Surveys:

Acoustic bat surveys for presence/absence will be accepted by ODNR for the 2020 season. Surveys should follow guidelines laid out in the USFWS Range-wide Indiana Bat Survey Guidelines (March 2020) with the following exceptions:

- Ohio survey dates are June 1 – August 15, 2020
- After conducting automated analyses using one or more of the currently available ‘approved’ acoustic bat ID programs<sup>1</sup>, qualitative analysis (i.e., manual vetting) of any calls recorded from state-endangered species (*Myotis sodalis*, *M. septentrionalis*<sup>2</sup>, *M. lucifugus*<sup>2</sup>, and *Perimyotis subflavus*<sup>2</sup>) must be completed.
  - At a minimum, for each detector site/night a program considered presence of state-listed bats likely, review all files (including no IDs) from that site/night. If more than one acoustic bat ID program is used, qualitative analysis must also include a comparison of the results of each program by site and night.

### During Field Season:

- **Prior to initiation of field work (a minimum of two weeks in advance)**, permittees must provide proposed survey plans to ODNR-DOW via e-mail. **Plans must be reviewed and approved by ODNR-DOW before ANY surveys take place.** Study plans must specify objectives, location details, dates of proposed work, and all other relevant details.

<sup>1</sup> <https://www.fws.gov/midwest/Endangered/mammals/inba/surveys/inbaAcousticSoftware.html>

<sup>2</sup> State listing as endangered effective July 1, 2020

**After Field Season:**

- By March 15, you must submit your final ODNR-DOW report(s) from the previous summer. You are not required to fill out the ODNR-DOW Wildlife Diversity Bat Excel Spreadsheet; instead, please forward your USFWS Midwestern US Spreadsheet (found here: <http://www.fws.gov/midwest/endangered/mammals/inba/inbasummersurveyguidance.html>) to the ODNR-DOW Bat Survey Coordinator and ODNR-DOW Permit Coordinator and include your state permit number along with an electronic copy of the project report. Electronic summaries emailed during the field season are NOT considered as full compliance of this reporting requirement.

## **Ohio Environmental Review Recommendations for projects involving disturbance near potential/known bat hibernacula (cliffs, caves, mines) or tree cutting:**

**Step 1:** Coordinate with Ohio Division of Wildlife (DOW) regarding existing records for state-listed endangered bat summer and/or winter occurrence information.

If project site contains a known bat hibernaculum(a) –

- For state-listed endangered species other than the Indiana bat, a recommendation of 0.25-mile tree cutting buffer around all known entrances to protect existing conditions at the hibernaculum(a). If the project involves subsurface disturbance, consultation with DOW is required.
- Limited summer and winter tree cutting may be permitted within the buffer following guidelines detailed below. Coordinate with DOW before cutting.

If a project site does not contain known bat hibernaculum(a)

- Conduct a habitat assessment (desktop or field-based, using methods detailed in current USFWS Range-wide Indiana Bat Guidelines) to determine if a potential hibernaculum(a) is present within the action area.

**Step 2:** When conducted, a presence/absence survey must follow current DOW guidelines.

**Step 3:** If a state-listed endangered bat is captured or recorded during the survey:

- Recommendation of no summer tree cutting, or limited cutting following guidelines detailed below, within 5 miles of the capture site if a roost is not located.
- Recommendation of no summer tree cutting, or limited cutting following guidelines detailed below, within 2.5 miles of a roost tree if located.

If no state-listed endangered bat is captured or recorded during the survey:

- Summer tree cutting may proceed for 5 years before a new survey is needed under state guidance.

**Limited summer tree cutting guidance for bats that are only state-listed endangered:** Limited tree cutting in summer may be permitted after consultation with DOW, but clearing trees with the following characteristics should be avoided unless they pose a hazard: dead or live trees of any size with loose, shaggy bark; crevices, holes, or cavities; live trees of any species with DBH  $\geq$  20.

## **FREQUENTLY ASKED QUESTIONS**

### **When does the Bat Survey protocol have to be used?**

This protocol should be used anytime Indiana bat, northern long-eared bat, little brown bat, or tricolored bat summer presence/probable absence surveys are conducted in the state of Ohio. For 2020 only, acoustic surveys will meet the ODNR-DOW requirements unless new guidance allowing for the handling of bats during presence/absence surveys is released from USFWS.

### **How many net surveys are required for presence/probably absence?**

As described in the current USFWS Range-wide Indiana Bat Guidelines: Linear projects: a minimum of 2 detector nights per km (0.6 miles) of suitable summer habitat

Non-linear projects: a minimum of 8 detector nights per 123 acres (0.5 km<sup>2</sup>) of suitable summer habitat. At least 2 detector locations per 123 acre "site" shall be sampled until at least 8 detector nights has been completed over the course of at least 2 calendar nights (may be consecutive). For example:

- 4 detectors for 2 nights each (can sample the same location or move within the site)
- 2 detectors for 4 nights each (can sample the same location or move within the site)
- 1 detector for 8 nights (must sample at least 2 locations and move within the site)

### **How long are the results of the surveys valid for an assessment of an area?**

Mist-net or acoustic surveys documenting probable absence of state-listed endangered bats are valid for five years.

### **When can acoustic surveys occur in Ohio?**

In Ohio, acoustic surveys may only be conducted from June 1 through August 15 unless indicated otherwise in your state permit. Any surveys outside of the June 1 - August 15 timeframe cannot be used in Ohio to assess the presence/probable absence of state-listed bats.

### **Can a presence/probable absence survey be conducted within a known Indiana bat and/or northern long-eared bat capture/detection buffer?**

Surveys generally cannot be used to document presence/probable absence of state-listed endangered bats bat where presence of the species has already been confirmed by prior surveys.

### **What if a project is proposing to clear trees between April 1 and September 30 when bats may be present but no bat records exist in the project area?**

Any Ohio project that is not within a known bat record buffer, and tree clearing between April 1 and September 31 is being proposed, may have a presence/absence survey conducted between June 1 and August 15 following the range-wide guidance. If a presence/absence survey is not performed, presence of listed bats is assumed.

### **How does take of northern long-eared bats differ from Indiana bats?**

Under Ohio law, there is no exemption for take of any listed bat species.



# Ohio Department of Natural Resources

MIKE DeWINE, GOVERNOR

MARY MERTZ, DIRECTOR

**Office of Real Estate**

*John Kessler, Chief*  
2045 Morse Road – Bldg. E-2  
Columbus, OH 43229  
Phone: (614) 265-6621  
Fax: (614) 267-4764

September 25, 2020

Bradley Rolfes  
GAI Consultants  
6000 Town Center Blvd., Suite 300  
Canonsburg, PA 15317

**Re:** 20-728; Duke Energy Pierce Substation T-Line Relocation Project

**Project:** The proposed project involves realignment will include relocation of an approximate 0.22-miles of 345kV line in support of the Pierce Substation Expansion Project. Two (2) steel monopole structures will be installed near the existing Pierce Substation.

**Location:** The proposed project is located in New Richmond, Clermont County, Ohio.

The Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) has completed a review of the above referenced project. These comments were generated by an inter-disciplinary review within the Department. These comments have been prepared under the authority of the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 661 et seq.), the National Environmental Policy Act, the Coastal Zone Management Act, Ohio Revised Code and other applicable laws and regulations. These comments are also based on ODNR's experience as the state natural resource management agency and do not supersede or replace the regulatory authority of any local, state or federal agency nor relieve the applicant of the obligation to comply with any local, state or federal laws or regulations.

**Natural Heritage Database:** The Natural Heritage Database has the following records at or within a one-mile radius of the project area:

Virginia-mallow (*Ripariosida hermaphrodita*), P  
Wartyback (*Cyclonaias nodulata*), E  
Purple wartyback (*Cyclonaias tuberculata*), SC  
Butterfly (*Ellipsaria lineolata*), E  
Elephant-ear (*Elliptio crassidens*), E  
Black sandshell (*Ligumia recta*), T  
Washboard (*Megaloniais nervosa*), E  
Threehorn wartyback (*Obliquaria reflexa*), T  
Sheepnose (*Plethobasus cyphus*), E, FE  
Ohio pigtoe (*Pleurobema cordatum*), E  
Round pigtoe (*Pleurobema sintoxia*), SC  
Ebonyshell (*Reginaia ebenus*), E  
Monkeyface (*Theliderma metanevra*), E  
Blue catfish (*Ictalurus furcatus*), SC

Shoal chub (*Macrhybopsis hyostoma*), E  
Channel darter (*Percina copelandi*), T

The review was performed on the project area you specified in your request as well as an additional one-mile radius. Records searched date from 1980. This information is provided to inform you of features present within your project area and vicinity.

Please note that Ohio has not been completely surveyed and we rely on receiving information from many sources. Therefore, a lack of records for any particular area is not a statement that rare species or unique features are absent from that area. Although all types of plant communities have been surveyed, we only maintain records on the highest quality areas.

Statuses are defined as: E = state endangered; T = state threatened; P = state potentially threatened; SC = state species of concern; SI = state special interest; A = species recently added to state inventory, status not yet determined; X = presumed extirpated in Ohio; FE = federal endangered, FT = federal threatened, FSC = federal species of concern, FC = federal candidate species.

**Fish and Wildlife:** The Division of Wildlife (DOW) has the following comments.

The DOW recommends that impacts to streams, wetlands and other water resources be avoided and minimized to the fullest extent possible, and that best management practices be utilized to minimize erosion and sedimentation.

The entire state of Ohio is within the range of the Indiana bat (*Myotis sodalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered species, the northern long-eared bat (*Myotis septentrionalis*), a state endangered and federally threatened species, the little brown bat (*Myotis lucifugus*), a state endangered species, and the tricolored bat (*Perimyotis subflavus*), a state endangered species. During the spring and summer (April 1 through September 30), these species of bats predominately roost in trees behind loose, exfoliating bark, in crevices and cavities, or in the leaves. However, these species are also dependent on the forest structure surrounding roost trees. If trees are present within the project area, and trees must be cut, the DOW recommends cutting only occur from October 1 through March 31, conserving trees with loose, shaggy bark and/or crevices, holes, or cavities, as well as trees with DBH  $\geq 20$  if possible. If trees are present within the project area, and trees must be cut during the summer months, the DOW recommends a mist net survey or acoustic survey be conducted from June 1 through August 15, prior to any cutting. Mist net and acoustic surveys should be conducted in accordance with the most recent version of the “OHIO DIVISION OF WILDLIFE GUIDANCE FOR BAT SURVEYS AND TREE CLEARING”. If state listed bats are documented, DOW recommends cutting only occur from October 1 through March 31, however, limited summer tree cutting may be acceptable after consultation with DOW (contact Sarah Stankavich, [sarah.stankavich@dnr.state.oh.us](mailto:sarah.stankavich@dnr.state.oh.us)).

The DOW also recommends that a desktop or field-based habitat assessment is conducted to determine if there are potential hibernaculum(a) present within the project area. Habitat assessments should be conducted in accordance with the current USFWS “Range-wide Indiana Bat Survey Guidelines” and submitted to Sarah Stankavich, [sarah.stankavich@dnr.state.oh.us](mailto:sarah.stankavich@dnr.state.oh.us) if potential hibernacula are present within .25 miles of the project area. If a potential hibernaculum is found, the DOW recommends a 0.25-mile tree cutting and subsurface disturbance buffer around the hibernaculum entrance, however, limited summer or winter tree cutting may be acceptable after consultation with DOW. If no tree cutting or subsurface impacts to a hibernaculum are proposed, this project is not likely to impact these species.

The project is within the range of the following listed mussel species.

Federally Endangered

rayed bean (*Villosa fabalis*)  
sheepnose (*Plethobasus cyphus*)  
fanshell (*Cyprogenia stegaria*)  
pink mucket (*Lampsilis orbiculata*)  
snuffbox (*Epioblasma triquetra*)

State Endangered

butterfly (*Ellipsaria lineolata*)  
ebonyshell (*Fusconaia ebena*)  
elephant-ear (*Elliptio crassidens crassidens*)  
little spectaclecase (*Villosa lienosa*)  
monkey face (*Quadrula metanevra*)  
Ohio pigtoe (*Pleurobema cordatum*)  
wartyback (*Quadrula nodulata*)  
washboard (*Megalonaias nervosa*)

State Threatened

fawnsfoot (*Truncilla donaciformis*)  
threehorn wartyback (*Obliquaria reflexa*)

Due to the location, and that there is no in-water work proposed in a perennial stream of sufficient size, this project is not likely to impact these species.

The project is within the range of the following listed mussel species.

State Endangered

bigeye shiner (*Notropis boops*)  
goldeye (*Hiodon alosoides*)  
northern madtom (*Noturus stigmosus*)  
shoal chub (*Macrhybopsis hyostoma*)  
shortnose gar (*Lepisosteus platostomus*)  
shovelnose sturgeon (*Scaphirhynchus platyrhynchus*)

State Threatened

American eel (*Anguilla rostrata*)  
blue sucker (*Cycleptus elongatus*)  
channel darter (*Percina copelandi*)  
mountain madtom (*Noturus eleutherus*)  
paddlefish (*Polyodon spathula*)  
river darter (*Percina shumardi*)

The DOW recommends no in-water work in perennial streams from April 15 through June 30 to reduce impacts to indigenous aquatic species and their habitat. If no in-water work is proposed in a perennial stream, this project is not likely to impact these or other aquatic species.

The project is within the range of the Kirtland's snake (*Clonophis kirtlandii*), a state threatened species. This secretive species prefers wet fields and meadows. Due to the location, the type of habitat within the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.



The project is within the range of the black-crowned night-heron (*Nycticorax nycticorax*), a state-threatened bird. Night-herons are so named because they are nocturnal, conducting most of their foraging in the evening hours or at night, and roost in trees near wetlands and waterbodies during the day. Night herons are migratory and are typically found in Ohio from April 1 through December 1 but can be found in more urbanized areas with reliable food sources year-round. Black-crowned night-herons primarily forage in wetlands and other shallow aquatic habitats, and roost in trees nearby. These night-herons nest in small trees, saplings, shrubs, or sometimes on the ground, near bodies of water and wetlands. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 1 to July 31. If this type of habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the northern harrier (*Circus hudsonis*), a state endangered bird. This is a common migrant and winter species. Nesters are much rarer, although they occasionally breed in large marshes and grasslands. Harriers often nest in loose colonies. The female builds a nest out of sticks on the ground, often on top of a mound. Harriers hunt over grasslands. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 15 to August 1. If this habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

Due to the potential of impacts to federally listed species, as well as to state listed species, we recommend that this project be coordinated with the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service.

**Water Resources:** The Division of Water Resources has the following comment.

The local floodplain administrator should be contacted concerning the possible need for any floodplain permits or approvals for this project. Your local floodplain administrator contact information can be found at the website below.

[http://water.ohiodnr.gov/portals/soilwater/pdf/floodplain/Floodplain%20Manager%20Community%20Contact%20List\\_8\\_16.pdf](http://water.ohiodnr.gov/portals/soilwater/pdf/floodplain/Floodplain%20Manager%20Community%20Contact%20List_8_16.pdf)

ODNR appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments. Please contact Sarah Tebbe, Environmental Specialist, at (614) 265-6397 or [Sarah.Tebbe@dnr.state.oh.us](mailto:Sarah.Tebbe@dnr.state.oh.us) if you have questions about these comments or need additional information.

Mike Pettegrew  
Environmental Services Administrator (Acting)